

# Notes

## Introduction

1. Ronald A. Knox, *Enthusiasm: A Chapter in the History of Religion* (Westminster Christian Classics, 1983), 20.
2. Brenda E. Basher, *Godly Women: Fundamentalism and Female Power* (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1998), 46.
3. Evelyn Waugh, *When the Going Was Good* (Boston: Little, Brown and Co., 1984), 238.
4. *Ibid.*, 239.
5. A noteworthy exception is Pope John Paul II, who writes that as his mother died when he was nine, “I do not have a clear awareness of her contribution, which must have been great, to my religious training” (*Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordination* [New York: Doubleday, 1996], 20). Instead the Pope was influenced by his father, “a deeply religious man. Day after day I was able to observe the austere way in which he lived. By profession he was a soldier and, after my mother’s death, his life became one of constant prayer . . . his example was in a way my first seminary, a kind of domestic seminary” (*ibid.*, 20).

## I Armies of Women

1. Tom Forrest, “Is the Church Attractive to Men?” *Origins* 17 (November 5, 1987): 382.
2. Barbara Leslie Epstein, *The Politics of Domesticity: Women, Evangelism, and Temperance in Nineteenth-Century America* (Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1981), 47.

3. Michael Argyle and Benjamin Beit-Hallahmi, *The Social Psychology of Religion* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1975), 75.
4. John K. White, "Men and the Church: A Case Study of Ministry to Men in a Medium Size Congregation" (D. M. Thesis, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, Deerfield, Ill., 1990), 5-6.
5. Stephen B. Clark, *Man and Woman in Christ: An Examination of the Roles of Men and Women in Light of Scripture and the Social Sciences* (Ann Arbor, Michigan: Servant Books, 1980), 635.
6. Arno Gaebelen, "Good-Bye Darwinism," quoted by Margaret Lamberts Bendroth in *Fundamentalism and Gender, 1875 to the Present* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 66.
7. William Bell Riley, "She-Men, or How Some Become Sissies," quoted by Bendroth, *Fundamentalism and Gender*, 66.
8. Bendroth, *Fundamentalism and Gender*, 65.
9. Paul A. Carter, *Another Part of the Twenties* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1977), 53-54.
10. Barbara Welter, "The Feminization of American Religion: 1800-1860" in *Clio's Consciousness Raised*, ed. Mary S. Hartman and Lois Banner (New York: Harper and Row, 1974), 22.
11. *Ibid.*, 42.
12. *Ibid.*, 43.
13. *Ibid.*, 89.
14. *Ibid.*, 19.
15. Con O'Leary, *The Last Rosary*, quoted by Colleen McDannell, *The Christian Home in Victorian America, 1840-1900* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, Midland Book Edition, 1994), 120.
16. The efforts are described by Colleen McDannell in "'True Men As We Need Them': Catholicism and the Irish-American Male," *American Studies* 27 (1986): 19-36.
17. Claudia Nelson, "Sex and the Single Boy: Ideals of Manliness and Sexuality in Victorian Literature for Boys," *Victorian Studies* 62 (Summer 1989): 548.
18. Thomas Hughes, *Tom Brown's School Days* (New York, Puffin Books, 1983), 236.
19. Quoted by Norman Vance, *The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 22.
20. Quoted in John Shelton Reed, *Glorious Battle: The Cultural Politics of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism* (Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 1996), 211.
21. John Shelton Reed, "'Giddy Young Men': A Counter-Cultural Aspect of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism," *Comparative Social Research* 11 (1989): 211.
22. David Hilliard, "UnEnglish and Unmanly: Anglo-Catholicism and Homosexuality," *Victorian Studies* 25 (1982): 181.
23. J. Eddowes, "The New Testament and Ritual: A Lecture," quoted by Reed "Giddy Young Men," 211.

24. Evelyn Waugh, *Brideshead Revisited* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1978), 26.

25. Pat Barker, *The Ghost Road* (New York: Penguin Books, Dutton, 1995), 67.

26. Hugh McLeod, *Religion and Society in England, 1850-1914* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1966), 156.

27. For some other members of Uranian circles who were attracted to varieties of Catholicism see Hilliard, "UnEnglish and Unmanly," 197-199. His inclusion of Msgr. Robert Hugh Benson is probably unwarranted, although the Benson family was very odd. Benson's brother wrote novels which have become popular in modern homosexual circles, but the most famous, *David Blaize*, is a sympathetic celebration of attractive qualities (physical, emotional, and spiritual) in boys and young men. Although it mentions schoolboy homosexual experimentation, it does not hold it up as an ideal.

28. James R. Moore, *Religion in Victorian Britain*, Vol. 3, *Sources* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1988), 77.

29. Paul Johnson, "Anglicanism, Organic Sin, and the Church of Sodom," *The Spectator* 277 (22 November 1996): 30.

30. William Oddie, "My Time at Homoerotic College," *The Spectator*, 277 (7 December 1996): 21. Oddie says that when he was at St. Stephen's House at Oxford, he "estimated that fully two-thirds were openly homosexual" (20) as Anglo-Catholics especially tended to be homosexual. At St. Stephen's men were given women's names (21) (a custom at some Catholic seminaries in North America) and is now "a hotbed of radical feminism" (21). Cuddeson, still too peculiar, also had a reputation for homosexuality. Oddie sadly concurs that "in the Church of England sodomy is on the verge of becoming part of that Church's semi-official culture" (20). There are few men in the pews of Anglican churches.

31. William A. Christian, Jr., *Person and God in a Spanish Valley* (New York and London: Seminar Press, 1972), 136.

32. *Ibid.*, 152.

33. Patricia Cayo Sexton, *The Feminized Male: Classrooms, White Collars and the Decline of Manliness* (New York: Random House, 1969), 97.

34. Lewis M. Terman and Catherine Cox Miles, *Sex and Personality: Studies in Masculinity and Femininity* (New York: Russell and Long, 1968).

35. *Ibid.*, 201.

36. *Ibid.*, 204.

37. Testosterone can fluctuate with emotions. Being successful raises testosterone levels in both men and women. Rosalind Miles notes in passing that "Dr James Dabbs of Georgia State University told the American Association for the Advancement of Science Annual Congress in 1989 that a survey of men in different professions showed that vicars displayed the lowest levels of testosterone, while 'actors and American football players' had the highest" (*The Rites of Man: Love, Sex and Death in the Making of the Male* [London: Grafton Books, 1991], 212). Perhaps men with low testosterone are attracted to being vicars; more probably the discouraging nature of the work and the low status they have among men produces the emotional state which in turn brings about low testosterone levels.

38. Terman and Miles, *Sex and Personality*, 220.
39. Ibid.
40. Ibid, 153.
41. Ibid, 9: “Most emphatic warning is necessary against the assumption that an extremely feminine score for males or an extremely masculine score for females can serve as an adequate basis for the diagnosis of homosexuality, whether overt or latent.”
42. Charles S. Prebish, “Religion and Sport: Convergence or Identity?” *Religion and Sport: The Meeting of Sacred and Profane*, ed. Charles S. Prebish. (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1993).
43. Claire M. Renzetti and Daniel J. Curran, *Women, Men, and Society: The Sociology of Gender* (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1989), 262.
44. James H. Fichter, “Why Aren’t Males So Holy?” *Integrity* 9 (May 1955): 3.
45. Argyle and Beit-Hallahmi, *Social Psychology*, 71.
46. Michael Argyle, *Religious Behaviour* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1958), 76.
47. C. Daniel Batson and W. Larry Ventis, *The Religious Experience: A Social -Psychological Perspective* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1982), 360.
48. Gail Malmgreen, “Domestic Discords: Women and the Family in East Cheshire Methodism, 1750-1830,” in *Disciplines of Faith: Studies in Religion, Patriarchy and Politics* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987), 56.
49. Kenneth Guentert, “Kids Need To Learn Their Faith From Men, Too,” *U. S. Catholic* 65 (Feb 1990): 14.
50. David de Vaus and Ian McAllister, “Gender Differences in Religion: A Test of the Structural Location Theory,” *American Sociological Review* 52 (1987): 472.
51. George Gallup, Jr. and Jim Castelli, *The Peoples Religion: American Faith in the 90’s* (New York: Macmillan, 1989), 50.
52. Barry A. Kosmin and Seymour P. Lachman, *One Nation Under God: Religion in Contemporary American Society* (New York: Harmony Books, 1993), 210-11. See also Dean R. Hoge and David A. Roozen, “Research on Factors Influencing Church Commitment” in Dean R. Hoge and David A. Roozen, eds., *Understanding Church Growth and Decline, 1950-1978*, (New York: Pilgrim Press, 1979), 42-68; Gerhard E. Lenski’s “Social Correlates of Religious Interest,” *American Sociological Review* 18 (October 1953): 533-544.
53. Robert Moore and Douglas Gillette, *King Warrior Magician Lover Re-discovering the Archetypes of the Mature Masculine* (New York: HarperCollins, 1990), xviii.
54. Argyle and Beit-Hallahmi, *Social Psychology*, 75. Jews were not included in one census, but evidence indicates that men are more observant than women. Argyle, *Religious Behavior*, 77.
55. George Barna, *Index of Leading Spiritual Indicators* (Dallas: Word Publishing, 1996), 87.
56. Lyle E. Schaller, *It’s a Different World: the Challenge for Today’s Pastor* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1987) 61-62.

57. George Barna, “The Battle for the Hearts of Men,” *New Man*, 4:1 (January-February 1997): 42.

58. Patrick M. Arnold, *Wildmen, Warriors, and Kings: Masculine Spirituality in the Bible* (New York: Crossroad, 1991), 68; Kenneth L. Woodward, “Gender and Religion: Who’s Really Running the Show,” *Commonweal* 120:6 (22 November 1996): 10.

59. Jim Castelli and Joseph Gremillion, *The Emerging Parish: The Notre Dame Study of Parish Life Since Vatican II* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1987), 68-69.

60. Ed Wilcock, “How We Lost Our Manliness,” *Integrity* 9 (May 1955): 12.

61. Fichter, “Why Aren’t Males So Holy?” 3-4.

62. Fichter, *Social Relations in the Urban Parish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1954), 91.

63. Gallup and Castelli, *The People’s Religion*, 50.

51 percent of men and 63 percent of women say that religion is not outdated and can answer all or most of today’s problems.

58 percent of men and 69 percent of women say they have a ‘great deal’ or ‘quite a lot’ of confidence in the church as an institution.

51 percent of men and 69 percent of women say prayer is ‘very important’ to them.

33 percent of men and 45 percent of women say reading the Bible is ‘very important.’

38 percent of men and 47 percent of women say attending church is ‘very important.’

38 percent of men and 55 percent of women say that receive a ‘great deal’ of comfort and support from their religious beliefs.

64. George Barna, *Index*, 87. Barna’s silent inclusion of women’s greater interest in horoscopes shows that women’s religiosity is free-floating, and might alight on something other than Christianity.

65. Peter L. Benson and Carolyn H. Eklin, *Effective Christian Education: A National Study of Protestant Congregations. A Summary Report on Faith, Loyalty, and Congregational Life* (Minneapolis, Mn.: Search Institute, 1990), 17. In the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ) 41 percent of the males and 35 percent of the females; in the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, 58 percent of the males and 48 percent of the females, in the Presbyterian Church USA 44 percent of the males and 34 percent of the females, in the United Church of Christ 48 percent of the males and 33 percent of the females, in the United Methodist Church 43 percent of the males and 28 percent of the females, but in the Southern Baptist Convention 23 percent of the males and 23 percent of the females.

66. *Ibid.*

67. Edward H. Thompson, Jr., “Beneath the Status Characteristic: Gender Variations in Religiousness,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 30 (1991): 381.

68. Cheryl Townsend Gilkes, “‘Together and in Harness’: Women’s Traditions in the Sanctified Churches,” *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 10 (1985): 678.

69. David O. Moberg, *The Church as a Social Institution: The Sociology of American Religion* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1962), 397. This may be so because rural areas still have a stronger ideology of masculinity, which finds expression in farming and hunting, than urban areas, and as we shall see, masculinity and religiousness (at least of the Christian variety) do not get along well in our culture.

70. Ann Lee Starr, *The Bible Status of Women* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1987), 379.

71. Ibid.

72. David I. Macleod, *Building Character in the American Boy: The Boy Scouts, YMCA, and Their Forerunners, 1870-1920* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1983), 44.

73. Ibid., 42.

74. Ibid., 43.

75. Starr, *Bible Status*, 380.

76. G. Stanley Hall, *Adolescence, Its Psychology and Its Relation to Physiology, Anthropology, Sociology, Sex, Crime, Religion, and Education*, Vol. I (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1911), 225.

77. Carter, *Another Part*, 30.

78. Cortland Myers, *Why Men Do Not Go To Church* (New York: Funk and Wagnalls Co., 1899), xi.

79. Ibid., x. In fact the situation was worse for Catholics. The 1902 *New York Times* survey showed that 72.8 percent of Manhattan adults attending church services were women (McLeod, *Piety and Poverty*, 169). Some admit the gravity of the situation: *The Catholic Telegraph* once said that at the same communion rail there are everywhere ten young women for every one young man” (Carl Delos Case, *The Masculine in Religion* [Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1906], 23).

80. Ibid.

81. Hugh McLeod, *Piety and Poverty: Working-Class Religion in Berlin, London, and New York* (New York: Holmes and Meier, 1996), 169.

82. Howard Allen Bridgman, “Have We a Religion for Men,” *Andover Review* 6 (April 1890): 391.

83. Ibid., 391.

84. Ibid., 389.

85. Ibid., 391.

86. “Is It Manly To Be Christian? The Debate in Victorian and Modern America” in *Redeeming Men; Religion and Masculinities*, ed. Stephen B. Boyd, W. Merle Longwood, and Mark Muesse (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996), 80.

87. Frances Trollope, *Domestic Manners of the Americans* Vol. 1 (New York: Dodd Meade and Company, 1894), 103-104.

88. Quoted in Ann Douglas, *The Feminization of American Culture* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1977), 98.

89. Quoted, *ibid.*
90. Joseph E. Kett, *Rites of Passage: Adolescence in America 1790 to the Present* (New York: Basic Books, 1977), 65.
91. Douglas, *Feminization*, 97.
92. Helen Lefkowitz Horowitz, *Alma Mater: Desire and Experience in the Women's Colleges from Their Nineteenth-Century Beginnings to the 1930s* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1985), 43.
93. Quoted Welter, "The Feminization of American Religion," 139.
94. Ted Ownby, *Subduing Satan: Religion, Recreation, and Manhood in the Rural South 1865-1920* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990), 129.
95. Ownby writes: "Records of twenty-seven evangelical churches reveal that between 1868 and 1906 women constituted about 62 percent of the churches' members" (*Ibid.*, 129).
96. Whitney R. Cross, *The Burned-Over District: The Social and Intellectual History of Enthusiastic Religion in Western New York, 1800-1850* (New York: Harper and Row, Harper Torchbooks, 1965), 177.
97. Ryan, *Cradle*, 75. See also Curtis D. Johnson, "Women: Agents of the Gospel Message," in *Islands of Holiness: Rural Religion in Upstate New York 1790-1860* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989), 53-66.
98. Ryan, *Cradle*, 77.
99. Paul E. Johnson, "Women formed majorities of the membership of every church at every point in time. But in every church, men increased their proportion of the communicants during revivals, indicating that revivals were family experiences and that women were converting the men" (*A Shopkeeper's Millennium: Society and Revivals in Rochester, New York 1815-1837* [New York, Hill and Wang, 1978], 108). Mary E. Ryan says that "the proportion of females in the revivals was in excess of their presence in the population of the worship, it was slightly lower than their proportion of overall church membership. The preponderance of women also varied slightly over time, tending to decline in the middle of the revival cycle" (*Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County, New York, 1790-1865* [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981], 80).
100. Johnson, *Islands*, 55.
101. Richard D. Shields, "The Feminization of American Congregationalism 1730-1835" *American Quarterly* 33 (Spring 1981): 48.
102. Donald G. Mathews, *Religion in the Old South* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977), 47.
103. Epstein, *The Politics of Domesticity*, 45.
104. *Ibid.*, 48.
105. *Ibid.*, 49.
106. *Ibid.*, 59.
107. Cotton Mather, *Ornaments for the Daughters of Zion* (Boston, 1692), 44-45.
108. Herbert Moller says: "While in New England immigration males outnumbered

bered females three to two, the ratio was six to one in the Virginia immigration” (“Sex Composition and Correlated Culture Patterns of Colonial America,” *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd series, 2 [1945]: 118).

109. Gerald F. Moran and Maris A. Vinovskis, *Religion, Family, and the Life Course: Explorations in the Social History of Early America* (Ann Arbor; University of Michigan Press, 1992), 66. Moran and Vinovskis show that over the course of the seventeenth century, church membership became more and more feminized; see *Religion*, 67, 85–90. They explain it as the result of the use of bridal metaphors in preaching (*Religion*, 98–99). By the onset of the Revolution, “the median percentage of women at admission had reached 65” (*Religion*, 101). Robert G. Pope notes the early decline of religious commitment among men: “The percentage of men among the new communicants is revealing: in 1632–1649 they represented 43 percent of the increment; in 1650–1669 this figure dropped to 35 percent; and in 1670–1689, to 33 percent. The same pattern holds for owning the covenant. By the final decade three out of every four half-way covenant members were women” (*The Half-Way Covenant: Church Membership in Puritan New England* [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969], 217–218). This is even more striking since over half the population was male.

110. Pope, *The Half-Way Covenant*, 218.

111. Grace Davie, *Religion in Britain since 1945: Believing without Belonging* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1994), 118.

112. Douglas Davies et al, *Church and Religion in Rural England* (Edinburgh: T and T Clark, 1991), 245–246. The others show low medium or medium religious commitment. Men showed a far lesser belief in life after death (30 percent) than did women (53 percent) (Davies, *Church and Religion*, 253). Or, for the more statistically minded, 27 percent of males showed low religious commitment, 29 percent medium high or high religious commitment, as compared to 18 percent low and 43 percent medium-high or high religious commitment among working females and 15 percent low and 48 percent medium-high or high religious commitment among non-working females. See David Gerard, “Religious Attitudes and Values” in *Values and Social Change in Britain* (London: Macmillan, 1985), ed. Mark Abrams, David Gerard and Noel Timms, 70–71.

113. Davie, *Religion in Britain*, 118.

114. Peter Brierley, “Christian” England: *What the 1989 Church Census Revealed* (London: MARC Europe, 1991), 79. A even bigger drop has occurred among young men: “Roman Catholic men in their twenties fell considerable in the 1980s, and a smaller drop in women” (Ibid., 87). Among Anglicans the percentage of men 1979–1989 dropped 6% (Ibid., 85).

115. Davie, *Religion in Britain*, 118.

116. Ibid., 119.

117. Ibid, 119–20.

118. Eric Jacobs and Robert Worcester, *We British: Britain under the MORIScope* (London: Weidenfield and Nicholson, 1990), 81–82.

84 percent of women believe in God, but only 67 percent of men;



9 percent of women say they do not believe in God, but nearly twice as many men (16 percent) say the same

72 percent of women believe in sin and 66 percent of men

27 percent of men do not believe in sin and 21 percent of women

76 percent of women believe in the soul and 58 percent of men

14 percent of women do not believe in the soul, but 30 percent of men

69 percent of women believe in heaven and 50 percent of men

22 percent of women do not believe in heaven to 40 percent of men

57 percent of women believe in life after death and 39 percent of men

25 percent of women do not believe in life after death, to 45 percent of men

42 percent of women believe in the devil, to 32 percent of men

50 percent of women do not believe in the devil and 60 percent of men

35 percent of women believe in hell and 37 percent of men

55 percent of women do not believe in hell to 64 percent of men.”

119. Ibid, 84.

120. Ibid, 76.

121. Ibid, 72.

122. Ibid, 73.

123. Ibid.

124. Gillian Rose, quoted in McLeod, *Piety and Poverty*, 151.

125. Richard Mudie-Smith, *The Religious Life of London* (London: Hodder and Saughton, 1904), 302. For the morning services 59,058 men and 82,975 women; for the evening services, 73,440 men and 132,232 women. There were major differences in denominations. The Church of England was the most feminized. For the morning services in London there were 46,343 men and 84,602 women, for the evening services 48,396 men and 96,680 women, almost a two to one ratio. For the larger Protestant denominations, the least feminized was the Salvation Army. It had 2,275 men and 2,138 women at the morning services, 4,411 men and 6,668 women at the evening services. The Roman Catholics in London had 18,784 men and 32,884 women at morning services, and 5,071 men and 9,890 women at evening services. The proportion of men among Roman Catholics was closer to that in the Church of England than that in the slightly less feminized, smaller Protestant denominations (442-46). Synagogues, by contrast, had 15,157 men and 4,375 women (265).

126. See “Women and Anglo-Catholicism” in Reed, *Glorious Battle*, 187-209.

127. S. A. Walker, quoted by John Shelton Reed, “A Female Movement’: The Feminization of Nineteenth-Century Anglo-Catholicism,” *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 57 (1988): 202.

128. John Charles Chambers, quoted in Reed, “A Female Movement,” 202.

129. Reed, “A Female Movement,” 204.

130. John Angell James, *Female Piety* (Pittsburgh: Soli Deo Gloria Publications, 1994), 262.

131. Quoted by Patrick Collinson, *Godly People: Essays on English Protestantism and Puritanism* (London: The Hambledon Press, 1983), 274.

132. Elisabeth Schneider-Böcklen and Dorothea Vorländer, “Die großen Kirchen—zumindest im Bereich der Bundesrepublik Deutschland - sind mit 80% Frauenanteil an der Zahl ihrer Mitarbeiter regelrecht, ‘Frauenbetriebe.’” (*Feminismus und Glaube* [Mainz: Matthia-Grünwald-Verlag, 1991], 15). The situation has been of long standing. In the Protestant churches of Berlin, “a survey of attendance at morning services in 1913 showed that women also made up about two-thirds of the congregations counted—though women may have made up a higher proportion of the total churchgoing population, as there are some indications that (as in London) evening congregations were more strongly female than those in the morning” (McLeod, *Piety and Poverty*, 163).

133. Fichter, “Why Aren’t Males So Holy?” 4.

134. In the basic Christian communities of São Paulo, 56.5 per cent of the middle-class membership and 66.2 percent of the lower-class membership is female (W. E. Hewitt, “Basic Christian Communities of the Middle-Classes in the Archdiocese of São Paulo” *Sociological Analysis* 48 [1987]: 160).

135. Leo T. Mahon, “Machismo and Christianity,” *Catholic Mind* 63 (Feb 1965): 4.

136. *Ibid.*, 5.

137. Carmen Lison-Tolosana, *Belmonte de los Caballeros: Anthropology and History in an Aragonese Community* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983), 288.

138. *Ibid.*, 295.

139. Stanley Brandes, *Metaphors of Masculinity: Sex and Status in Andalusian Folklore* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1980), 182.

140. Christian, *Person and God*, 134.

141. Lison-Tolosana, *Belmonte*, 309.

142. *Ibid.*, 338.

143. Ruth Graham, “Woman versus Clergy, Women pro Clergy” in *French Women and the Age of Enlightenment*, ed. Samia I. Spencer, (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984), 128.

144. *Ibid.*, 130.

145. Gerard Cholvy and Yves-Marie Hilaire, *Histoire religieuse de la France contemporaine*, Vol. III, (Toulouse: Bibliothèque historique Privat, 1988), 377.

146. Fernand Boulard writes: “Le comportement des sexes, très contrasté dans les périodes anciennes, évolue nettement vers un rapprochement des taux. Le recensement dominical qui a couvert le diocèse de Versailles le 23 novembre 1975, a fait apparaître que le taux de masculinité (proportion d’hommes dans l’assemblée des pratiquants) s’établissait presque partout entre 35 et 40% pour les plus de 25 ans; un peu plus faible dans les doyennés ruraux, il atteignait même 50%, soit la parité absolue de la pratique des sexes, en quelques doyennés urbains. Or, en 1907-1908, dans l’arrondissement de Versailles, ce taux était de 15.6%’ et vers 1880, moyenne de l’ensemble du diocèse, il n’atteignait pas 11%” (The behavior of the sexes, very different during former periods, has distinctly changed in the direction of a similarity of rates. The Sunday census which covered the diocese of Versailles on November 23, 1975 made it

clear that the rate of masculinity [the proportion of men in the assembly of practicing Catholics] has stabilized almost everywhere between 35 and 40% for those more than 25 years old; a little more weak among rural senior citizens, it attains an absolute part of 50% among some urban senior citizens. In contrast, in 1907-1908 in the neighborhood of Versailles, the rate was 15.6% and around 1880 for the whole diocese it did not reach 11%) (*Matériaux pour l'histoire religieuse du peuple français XIXe-XXe siècles* [Paris: Editions de L'Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, 1982], 19. However, the statistics in this book reveal a long-standing and massive difference in religious practice between French men and women.

147. Gabriel le Bras, *Etudes de sociologie religieuse*, Vol. 1 (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1955), 124.

148. *Ibid.*, 254.

149. *Ibid.*, 180. "On remarquera l'abondance des pascalisants et le dimorphisme des sexes."

150. *Ibid.*, 165.

151. "Les devoirs religieuse sont presque complètement négligés par les hommes ou pratiquée seulement pour la forme. Les femmes seul les observent généralement." Cholvy and Hilaire, *Histoire*, 299.

152. Christianne Marcilhacy, *Le Diocèse d'Orléans sous l'épiscopat de Mgr. Dupanloup* (Paris: Librairie Plon, 1962), 531.

153. The current situation in the Catholic Church, in which contraception is officially condemned but those who adhere to this doctrine are largely excluded from Catholic education and diocesan structures, may be due to the same strategy of not offending women.

154. "Que l'on y fasse une sérieuse attention; qu'on ne s'aliène pas la femme par d'imprudentes riguers; la chose est d'une immense gravité. La génération naissante est entre les mains de la femme, l'avenir est à elle. . . . Si la femme nous échappe—*le nous vise ses lecteurs prêtres*—, avec elle tout peut disparaître et s'abîmer dans le gouffre de l'athéisme, croyance, morale, et toute notre civilisation" Quoted by Langlois, Claude. "Féminisation du catholicisme," in *Histoire de la France religieuse*, Vol. 3, *Du rois Très Chrétien à la laïcité républicaine*, ed. Jacques Le Goff (Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1991), 303.

155. Michelet, Jules, *Du Prêtre, de la femme, de la famille*, 4th ed. (Paris: Hachette, 1845), 8.

156. *Ibid.*, 63.

157. Marcilhacy, *Le Diocèse d'Orléans*, 533.

158. *Ibid.*

159. See Marcilhacy, *Le Diocèse d'Orléans* 215 and Cholvy and Hilaire, *Histoire religieuse*, vol. 1, 256.

160. Rosemary Radford Reuther, "Christianity and Women in the Modern World," in *Today's Woman in World Religions*, ed. Arvind Sharma (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994), 285.

161. Kosmin and Lachman, *One Nation Under God*, 220.
162. Mudie-Smith, ed., *The Religious Life of London*, 265.

## 2 *Can a Man Be a Christian?*

1. Mary Maples Dunn, “Saints and Sinners: Congregational and Quaker Women in the Early Colonial Period,” *American Quarterly*, 582.
2. Tony Walter, “Why Are Most Churchgoers Women? A Literature Review,” *Vox Evangelica* 20 (1990), 74.
3. Walter Rauschenbusch, *Christianity and the Social Crisis* (1907. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1991), 367.
4. *Ibid.*
5. Rosemary Radford Reuther and Rosemary Skinner Keller, *Women and Religion in America*, Vol. 1, *Nineteenth Century* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1981), ix-x.
6. Simone de Beauvoir, *The Second Sex*, trans. and ed. H. M. Parshley (1953. New York: Everyman’s Library, Alfred E. Knopf, 1993), 653.
7. Francis Trollope, *Domestic Manners of the Americans*, Vol. 1 (New York, Dodd, Mead, and Company, 1894), 103.
8. Trollope, *Domestic Manners*, Vol. 1, 113.
9. *Ibid.*, 112.
10. Ronald A. Knox, *Enthusiasm: A Chapter on the History of Religion* (1950. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1983), 570-571.
11. Trollope, *Domestic Manners*, 102.
12. Cotton Mather, *Ornaments for the Daughter of Sion* (Boston, 1648), 45.
13. Quoted by Ruth Graham in “Women versus Clergy, Women pro Clergy,” in *French Women and the Age of the Enlightenment*, ed. Samia I. Spencer (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984), 131.
14. Freud was working toward a distinction of physical sexuality and cultural gender identity, and there seems to be a consistent theory underlying his various observations. Judith van Herik has collected all the relevant passages from Freud and analyzed their significance for a theory of gender in *Freud on Femininity and Faith* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982).
15. Judith van Herik, *Freud on Femininity and Faith* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), 55.
16. *Ibid.*, 150.
17. Quoted in Reuther, *Women and Religion in America*, Vol. 1, 13.
18. Ann Douglas, *The Feminization of American Culture* (New York: Alfred E. Knopf, 1977), 47.
19. *Ibid.*, 75.
20. James Alberione, *Woman: Her Influence and Zeal as an Aid to the Priesthood*, trans. by The Daughters of St. Paul (Boston: St. Paul Editions, 1964), 97.
21. *Ibid.*, p. 98.

22. Ibid., p. 88.
23. Quoted in Douglas, *Feminization*, 108
24. Douglas, *Feminization*, 110.
25. Quoted in Douglas, *Feminization*, 121.
26. Douglas, *Feminization*, 116.
27. For a compendium of outrageous things that Catholics have said about Mary see Hilda Graef, *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion* (Westminster, Maryland: Christian Classics, 1985).
28. Sarah J. Hale, *Woman's Record* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1860), xxxvi.
29. Nina Baym, "Onward Christian Women: Sarah J. Hale's History of the World," *New England Quarterly* 63 (1990): 253.
30. Hale, *Woman's Record*, xlv.
31. Ibid., 129.
32. Ibid.
33. Bridgman, "Have We a Religion for Men?" *Andover Review* 6 (April 1890): 389.
34. Quoted in *The Legacy of the Middle Ages*, ed. C. G. Crump and E. F. Jacob (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1962), 402.
35. "Ad Omnes mulieres," quoted in Bede Jarrett, *Social Theories of the Middle Ages, 1200-1500* (New York: F. Ungar, 1966), 70-72.
36. Quoted in Crump and Jacob, *Legacy*, 432.
37. Quoted in Perry Miller, "Jonathan Edward's Sociology of the Great Awakening," *New England Quarterly* 21 (1948): 68.
38. Preface by Placid Jordan, in Gertrud von le Fort, *The Eternal Woman: The Woman in the Timeless Woman*, trans. Placid Jordan (Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing Co., 1961), viii.
39. Jordan, "Preface," in von le Fort, *Eternal Woman*, ix.
40. Von Balthasar sees the lack of men, which I think is in part a result of the Aristotelian theory he accepts, as a confirmation of his theory: "We should therefore not be surprised, but rather feel how fitting it is, that normally far more women than men participate in the celebration of the Church's Eucharistic banquet" ("Thoughts on the Priesthood of Women," *Communio* 23 [1996]: 707).
41. Manfred Hauke, *Women in the Priesthood? A Systematic Analysis in the Light of the Order of Nature and Redemption*, trans. David Kipp (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1986) 304. He concurs with Hans Urs von Balthasar who claims "every member of the Church, even the priest, must maintain a feminine receptivity to the Lord of the Church" (*New Elucidations*, trans. Mary Theresilde Skerry [San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1986], 198).
42. F. X. Arnold, *Woman and Man: Their Nature and Mission* (New York: Herder and Herder, 1963), 54-55.
43. Ibid., 55-56.
44. George T. Montague, *Our Father, Our Mother: Mary and the Faces of God* (Steubenville, Ohio: Franciscan University Press, 1990), 85.

45. Friedrich Nietzsche, *Beyond Good and Evil*, 259, in Basic Writings of Nietzsche, trans. and ed. Walter Kaufman (New York: Modern Library, 1968), 393.
46. *Ibid.*, 250.
47. Walter, “Why Are Most Churchgoers Women?” 87.
48. *Ibid.*, 79.
49. *Ibid.*, 87.
50. *Ibid.*, 88.

### 3 *What Is Masculinity?*

1. J. M. Tanner, *Foetus into Man: Physical Growth from Conception to Maturity* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1978), 56. R. J. Stoller elaborates: “The biologic rules governing sexual behavior in mammals are simple. In all, including man, the ‘resting’ state of tissue is female. We can now demonstrate without exception, in all experiments performed on animals, that if androgens in the proper amount and biochemical form are withheld during critical periods in fetal life, anatomy and behavior typical of that species’ males do not occur, regardless of genetic sex. And if androgens in the proper amount and form are introduced during crucial periods in fetal life, anatomy and behavior typical of that species’ males do occur, regardless of genetic sex” (*Presentations of Gender* [New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985], 74).

2. Eleanor Emmons Maccoby and Carol Nagy Jacklin, *The Psychology of Sex Differences* (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1974), 351-352.

3. For a review of current thought on possible biological influences on the characteristic behavior of men, see Perry Treadwell’s “Biological Influences on Masculinity,” in *The Making of Masculinities: The New Men’s Studies*, ed. Harry Brod (Boston: Allen and Unwin, 1987), 259-286.

4. Elisabeth Badinter writes: “this very erotic relationship teaches the infant the nirvana of passive dependence and will leave indelible marks on the adult’s psyche. But the consequences of this experience are not the same for the boy and girl. For the girl, it is the basis of identification with her own sex, whereas for the boy it is an inversion of later roles. To become a man, he will have to learn to differentiate himself from his mother and repress, within the deepest part of himself, that delicious passivity in which he was entirely and exclusively one with her. The erotic bond between mother and child is not limited to oral satisfactions. It is she who, by the care she gives him, awakens all his sensuality, initiates him to pleasure, and teaches him to love his body” (XY: *On Masculine Identity*, trans. Lydia Davis, [New York: Columbia University Press, 1995], 44-45).

5. Nancy Chodorow, *The Reproduction of Mothering: Psychoanalysis and the Sociology of Gender* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), 169.

6. Irene Fast, *Gender Identity: A Differentiation Model* (Hillsdale, New Jersey: The Analytic Press, 1984), 69.

7. Fast claims that there is “a pattern of femininity found in men who have not successfully resolved issues of gender differentiation” (*Gender Identity*, 69). This unre-

solved conflict can result in a variety of disorders: extreme misogyny, because the female represents the infantile in the man, (Ibid., 69), sado-masochism, which is found far more frequently in males than females (Ibid., 70), and perhaps erotic disorders which cause the man to follow the mothers erotic gaze to a man (passive homosexuality) or to a boy (pedophilia). It is a sensitive subject, but the source of pedophilia among the clergy may be the same failure to achieve full differentiation from the feminine, a failure that causes some of them also to be attracted to religion, because they see it as a feminine activity. See also Ralph R. Greenson, “Dis-Identifying from Mother: Its Special Importance for the Boy,” *International Journal of Psycho-analysis* 49 (1968): 370-374.

8. Margaret Mead noted “The boy learns that he must make an effort to enter the world of men, that this first act of differentiating himself from his mother, of realizing his own body as his and different from hers, must be continued in long years of effort—which may not succeed” (*Male and Female: A Study of the Sexes in a Changing World* [1944. Westport Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1977], 151).

9. Ronald R Levant says: “At an early age, then, boys are given the prize of a sense of themselves as separate individuals; in return, they are required to give up their close attachment to their mothers. Hence, as boys grow up, yearnings for maternal closeness and attachment (which never completely go away) become associated with the fear of losing themselves as separate. When such yearnings for maternal closeness begin to emerge into awareness, they often bring with them terrible images of the loss of the sense of identity” (“Toward a Reconstruction of Masculinity” in *A New Psychology of Men* [NY: Basic Books, 1995], 244). See Karen Horney, “The Dread of Women,” *International Journal of Psycho-Analysis* (13) 1932, 348-360.

10. See Liam Hudson and Bernardine Jacot, “The Male Wound” in *The Way Men Think: Intellect, Intimacy and the Erotic Imagination* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991), 137-158.

11. Ibid., 49.

12. David Bakan, *The Duality of Human Existence: Isolation and Communion in Western Man* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1966), 15.

13. Ibid., 15.

14. Ibid.

15. Bakan writes: “The separated being is destined to die. The only way in which there can be any biological continuity is through the act of sexual intercourse, resulting in the birth of another separate (*Duality*, 51).

16. Ibid., 40.

17. Ibid., 141.

18. Hudson and Jacot, *The Way Men Think*, 57.

19. Walter Ong, *Fighting for Life: Contest, Sexuality, and Consciousness* (1981. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1989), 16.

20. David Gilmore in *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity* (Haven: Yale University Press, 1990).

21. Ibid., 57. Peter N. Stearns says “One does not just become a man. A natural

passage of sexual maturation is not enough. In most societies, including our own, boys require a more extensive, arduous transition to manhood “ (*Be A Man! Males in Modern Society* [New York: Holmes and Meier, 1990], 16).

22. Stoller, *Presentations*, 17.

23. Gilmore, *Manhood*, 121.

24. *Ibid.*, 230.

25. *Ibid.*, 229.

26. Michael Levin, *Feminism and Freedom* (New Brunswick: Transaction Books, 1987), 8.

27. Warren Farrell, *The Myth of Male Power: Why Men Are the Disposable Sex* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1993).

28. Herb Goldberg, *The Hazards of Being Male: Surviving the Myth of Masculine Privilege* (1976. New York: Signet, 1987). See also James Harrison’s “Warning: The Male Sex Role May Be Dangerous to Your Health,” *Journal of Social Issues* 14:1 (1978): 65-86.

29. *Ibid.*, 5.

30. Farrell, *Myth*, 105. James Harrison concludes “the best available evidence confirms the psychosocial perspective that sex-role socialization accounts for a large part of men’s shorter life expectancy” (“Warning,” 65).

31. As Nicholas Davidson points out: “If toil and suffering have been women’s lot, then have also been men’s. It is no accident that women live longer than men, even in cultures that are said to oppress women (and may actually do so in some cases). Men have faced agony on blood-soaked battlefields, been worked to death in mines and on galley ships, and in all cultures die younger than women” (*The Failure of Feminism* [Buffalo: Prometheus Books, 1988], 50).

32. Goldberg, *Hazards*, 87

33. Richard A. Hawley, *Boys Will Be Men: Masculinity in Troubled Times* (Middlebury, Vermont: Paul S. Erikson, 1993), 17.

34. *Ibid.*, 18.

35. Arnold van Gennep, *The Rites of Passage*, trans. Monika K. Vizedom and Gabrielle L. Caffee (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1960), 10.

36. *Ibid.*, 11.

37. *Ibid.*, 15

38. Victor Turner, “Betwixt and Between: the Liminal Period in Rites of Passage” in *Betwixt and Between: Patterns of Masculine and Feminine Initiation*, ed. Louise Carus Mahdi, Steven Foster, and Meredith Little, (LaSalle, Illinois: Open Court, 1987), 9.

39. Alfred W. Howitt, *The Native Tribes of South-East Australia* (London: Macmillan, 1904), 532.

40. Van Gennep, *Rites*, 75.

41. *Ibid.*, 72.

42. Bruno Bettelheim notes “some features of male initiation rites apparently are



designed to make men as much as possible like women” (*Symbolic Wounds: Puberty Rites and the Envious Male* [London: Thames and Hudson, 1955], 107).

43. Gilbert A. Herdt reports that one boy, Kambo, feared that he was developing a birth canal because of his homosexual activities, which were supposed to help him turn into a man: “That fantasy, a free floating anxiety that semen ingestion might effect female traits in a boy, is a prevalent response among young novices” (*Guardians of the Flutes: Idioms of Masculinity* [New York: McGraw Hill Book Company, 1981], 281).

44. Mircea Eliade, *Rites and Symbols of Initiation: The Mysteries of Birth and Rebirth*, trans. by Williard R. Trask (1958. New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1965), 26.

45. Bettelheim, *Symbolic Wounds*, 36.

46. *Ibid.*

47. Monika Vizedom, *Rites and Relationships: Rites of Passage and Contemporary Anthropology*. Sage Research Papers in the Social Sciences: Cross Cultural Studies Series, no. 90-027, Vol. 4 (1976), 43.

48. Bettelheim notes “among some groups of young men hurtful scarification was as important a part of adolescent ritual as it is in initiation. German students were more than willing to suffer cutting and bloodletting, proudly considering their the dueling ordeal as a demonstration of their manliness and their worthiness to belong to the group” (*Symbolic Wounds*, 99).

49. Turner, “Betwixt and Between,” II.

50. Rosalind Miles, *The Rites of Man: Love, Sex and Death in the Making of the Male* (London: Grafton Books, 1991), 44.

51. *Ibid.*

52. *Ibid.*, 76.

53. Initiation is much more common among men. Bettelheim says “Nearly all students of initiation in preliterate society express the notion that initiation of girls is secondary to that of boys” (*Symbolic Wounds*, 246). That this should be so follows from the difference in development and relation to the mother that boys and girls experience, and to the fact that masculinity is an ideology that must be inculcated in boys.

54. Eliade, *Rites*, xiii.

55. Van Gennep, *Rites*, 105.

56. Harold R. Willoughby, *Pagan Regeneration: A Study of Mystery Initiations in the Greco-Roman World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1929. Midway Reprint 1974), 36-67.

57. Willoughby writes “Mithra himself had been for long centuries the god of battles, and his cult was an exclusively masculine one” (*Pagan Regeneration*, 152).

58. Franz Cumont, *The Mysteries of Mithras*, trans. Thomas J. McCormick (1903. New York: Dover Publications, Inc., 1956).

59. Eliade, *Rites*, 115.

60. Mircea Eliade, writes “For it is a fact that even Christianity, a revealed religion which did not originally imply any secret rite, which had proclaimed and propa-

gated itself in the broad light of day and for all men, came in the end to borrow from the liturgies and the vocabulary of the Hellenistic mysteries” (*Rites*, 121).

61. Mircea Eliade observes, “Le nombre de livres et études analysant les scénarios initiatiques camouflés dans les poèmes, les nouvelles et les romans, est considérable” (“L’initiation et le monde moderne” (The number of books and studies analyzing the serious of initiation hidden in poems, short stories, and novels, is considerable), *Initiation: Contributions to the theme of the Study-Conference of the International Association for the History of Religions Held at Strasbourg, September 17th to 22nd, 1964*, ed. C. J. Bleeker [Leiden: J. Brill, 1965], 12).

62. Frank S. Pittman III: “Before he is permitted to achieve victory, the hero must renounce his boyish selfishness, his fear of death and of humiliation, and even his desire for glory; he must be willing to give up his life for others” (*Man Enough: Fathers, Sons and the Search for Masculinity* [New York: G. P. Putnam’s Sons, 1993], 183).

63. See Robert Randall, “Return of the Pleiades,” *Natural History* 96 (June 1987): 43–52.

64. See Hope Nash Wolff, *A Study in the Narrative Structure of Three Epic Poems: Gilgamesh, the Odyssey, Beowulf* (New York: Garland Publishing Co., 1987).

65. *The Odyssey of Homer*, trans. Richard Lattimore (1965; New York: Perennial Library-Harper, 1975). Book and line numbers refer to this edition.

66. Howard W. Clarke, *The Art of the Odyssey* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice, 1967) 9.

67. *Ibid.*

68. Gilmore, *Manhood in the Making*, 39.

69. George E. Dimock Jr., “The Name of Odysseus,” in *Homer: A Collection of Critical Essays*, ed. George Steiner and Robert Fagles (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice, 1962) III.

70. Gilmore, *Manhood*, 38.

71. Wolff, *Study*, 57.

72. *Ibid.*

73. Dimock, “The Name of Odysseus,” 53. But Odysseus is also the one who suffers much.

74. Wolff, *Study*, 57

75. *Ibid.*

76. As Catherine Callen King notes, “Homer wants us to see Achilles as having somehow having crossed the bounds of *human nature*. One such indication is the pattern of fire imagery, which, beginning with the divinely kindled fire that blazes from his head at the trench and continuing through the evening star that marks the end of his duel with Hektor, contributes to our seeing Achilles as an increasingly deadly elemental force. Another indication is the series of lion similes, which suggests that Achilles’ deadly force is not only elemental but bestial as well” (*Achilles: Paradigms of the War Hero from Homer to the Middle Ages* [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987], 17–18).

77. P. L. Henry, “Furor Heroicus,” *Studia Germanica Gandensis* 3 (1961): 235.

78. See Henry, “Furor,” 237.
79. See Doreen M. E. Gillam, “The Use of the Term ‘æghæca’ in *Beowulf* at Lines 893 and 2592” *Neophilologus* 61 (1977): 600–618.
80. See S. L. Dragland, “Monster Man in *Beowulf*” *Neophilologus* 61 (1977): 606–618.
81. Gilbert Lewis, “Payback and Ritual in War in New Guinea,” in *War: A Cruel Necessity of The Bases of Institutional Violence*, ed. Robert A. Hinde and Helen F. Watson (London: I. B. Tauris Publishers, 1995), 34.

#### 4 *God and Man in Judaism: Fathers and the Father-God*

1. Gerhard van Rad, *Old Testament Theology*, trans. I. D. M. G. Stalker (New York: Harper and Row, 1962), 146.
2. Stephen Sapp, *Sexuality, the Bible, and Science* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 19xx), 3.
3. See Sapp, *Sexuality*, II.
4. Francis Martin notes that “while the Hebrew verb system distinguishes between masculine and feminine subjects, there is not one verb form in the Old Testament to be found in the feminine form when God is the subject” (*The Feminist Question: Feminist Theology in the Light of Christian Tradition* [Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1994], 234).
5. Rudolf Otto, *The Idea of the Holy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1958), p 26.
6. Julia Kristeva, *In the Beginning Was Love: Psychoanalysis and Faith*, trans. Arthur Goldhammer (1985. New York: Columbia University Press, 1987), 31.
7. Leo Strauss, “On the Interpretation of Genesis,” *L’Homme*, 1981 (21): 10.
8. *Ibid.*, 12.
9. Suzanne Heine, *Woman and Early Christianity: A Reappraisal*, trans. John Bowden (1986. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1987), 22.
10. Carol Myers, *Discovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), 27.
11. George T. Montague, *Our Father, Our Mother: Mary and the Faces of God* (Steubenville, Ohio: Franciscan University Press, 1990), 18.
12. John W. Miller, *Biblical Faith and Fathering: Why We Call God “Father”* (Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1989), 149.
13. *Ibid.*
14. *Ibid.*, 43.
15. *Ibid.*, 44–51.
16. Perhaps there are psychological elements in the story. A father may also develop a Laertes complex, and be jealous of the child as the one who will replace him in the normal course of human life, reproduction, and death.
17. Whether the Psalms were written by the historical David or a literary construct “David” is unimportant in this context.

5 *God and Man in Early Christianity: Sons in the Son*

1. “According to the Philosopher, a thing is denominated chiefly by its perfection, and by its end. Now generation signified something in the process of being made, whereas paternity signifies that something is something completed; and therefore the name Father is more expressive as regards the divine person than genitor or begetter” (*Summa Theologica*, Q. 33, Art. 2, ad 2. in *Basic Writings of Saint Thomas Aquinas*, vol. I, ed. Anton C. Pegis [New York: Random House, 1945], 326).

2. The central importance of the image of the Church as Bride is the subject of Claude Chevasse’s *The Bride of Christ: An Inquiry into the Nuptial Element in Early Christianity* (London, Faber and Faber, 1940).

3. As William Oddie observes, “this balance of love, obedience, obligation, and sacrifice has not, within Christian civilization, always been observed. What is perhaps more striking, however, is how unquestioned in practice its acceptance has often been” (*What Will Happen to God, Feminism and the Reconstruction of Christian Belief* [San Francisco: Ignatius, 1988], 55). Oddie cites the behavior of the men on the Titanic. A group of Washington media people began jokingly visiting the almost-forgotten Washington memorial to these men on the Titanic. What began as a joke became a serious ritual and a tribute to the “courage and sacrifice and grace under pressure” of these men (Ken Ringle, “First Class Tribute: A Night of Remembrance for Titanic’s Gentlemen,” *Washington Post* April 16, 1996). As Oddie says, “the sinking of the Titanic remains as a kind of modern icon of the assertion of sacrificial and Christ-like male authority” (*Ibid.*, 55).

4. Karl Barth: “He is not the saviour of woman as Jesus Christ is of his body the Church.” *Church Dogmatics*, vol. 3, *The Doctrine of Creation*, 54.1, trans. Harold Knight et al, (Edinburgh: T. T. Clark, 1960), 175.

5. David D. Gilmore, *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990), 230.

6. *Ibid.*, 230.

7. Boff rightly claims that this association of Mary, the Church, and the Spirit is widespread among Catholic theologians. For citation see n. 34 (Boff, *The Maternal Face of God*, 266) and n. 54 (Boff, *The Maternal Face of God*, 267). See also Hauke, *Women in the Priesthood? 277-296 and 316-317*.

8. Kolbe’s phrasing was “*Spiritus Sanctus: ‘quasi’ incarnatus est: Immaculata*” quoted by Leonardo Boff, *The Maternal Face of God: the Feminine and Its Religious Expressions*, trans. Robert R. Barr and John W. Diercksmeier (San Francisco: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1987), 96. See also Manfred Hauke, *Women in the Priesthood? A Systematic Analysis in the Light of the Order of Nature and Redemption*, trans. David Kipp (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1986), 277-296 and 316-317.

9. Boff, *The Maternal Face of God*, 93.

10. Otto, *The Idea of the Holy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1958), 23.

11. See Leon Harold Craig, *The War Lover: A Study of Plato’s Republic* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 65.

12. Thomas G. Weinandy, *The Father's Spirit of Sonship: Reconceiving the Trinity* (Edinburgh: T and T Clark, 1995), 17.

13. *Ibid.*, 28.

14. *Ibid.*, 35.

15. Hauke, *Women in the Priesthood*, 286.

16. *Ibid.*, 287.

17. David L. Schindler, *Heart of the World Center of the Church: Communio Ecclesiology, Liberalism, and Liberation* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1996), 8. Walter Kaspar says, “the Church is not only the image of the trinitarian *communio* but also its re-presentation” (“Church as ‘*Communio*,’” *Communio* 13 [Spring 1986], 108).

18. George T. Montague says “even the category ‘metaphor’ is inadequate., for our relationship with the Father is not just like Jesus’ relationship with the Father; it is an actual, if created, participation in that relationship (*Our Father, Our Mother: Mary and the Faces of God*. [Steubenville, OH: Franciscan University Press, 1990], 55). The doctrine of deification is almost forgotten by western Christians, and its absence has been filled by the pantheistically flavored “god(dess) within” of feminism.

19. The New Testament is also aware of the dangers of masculinity. The Pharisees, whose name means separatists, emphasized the external codes of holiness, that separated them from pagans and Jews who did not observe the law, but neglected the interior code of holiness.

20. See Mircea Eliade, *Rites and Symbols of Initiation*, trans. by William R. Trask (Harper Torchbooks, 1965), 121; and Hugo Rahner, *Greek Myths and Christian Mystery* (1957. London: Burns and Oats, 1963).

21. David Thomas, *Not Guilty: The Case in Defense of Men* (New York: William Morrow and Company, Inc.), p 57.

22. See Rahner, *Greek Myths and Christian Mystery*, 110-112.

23. Carl-Martin Edsman, “le baptême de feu signifiera une purification et une consécration; le rite d’initiation donnant droit à la participation au mystère céleste, de même que le baptême d’eau est la condition requise pour assister a mystère terrestre” (*Le Baptême de feu* [Leipzig, Alfred F. Lorenz, 1940], 135).

24. Edward C. Malone, *The Monk and the Martyr: The Monk as the Successor of the Martyr* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1950), 67.

25. Michael Novak writes: “Religions are built upon *ascesis*, a world that derives from the disciplines Greek athletes imposed upon themselves to give their wills and instincts command of their bodies; the word was borrowed by Christian monks and hermits. It signifies the development of character through patterns of self-denial, repetition, and experiment” (*The Joy of Sports: End Zones, Bases, Baskets, Balls, and the Consecration of the American Spirit*, rev. ed. [Lanham, Md.: Madison Books, 1994], 29).

26. The early monks lived “A life of martyrdom,’ for monks are an army always engaged in battle with the obstacles to love” (Jean Leclercq, François Vandenbroucke and Louis Bouyer. *The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*, trans. by the Benedictines of Holmes Eden Abbey [London, Burns and Oates, 1968], 183.)

27. Malone, *The Monk and the Martyr*, 57.

28. Colgrave writes: “[T]hey sought to win the martyr’s crown by extreme asceticism. In a seventh-century Irish homily, the writer describes three types of martyrdom: white martyrdom, which implies abandoning everything for God’s sake; blue martyrdom, freeing oneself from evil desires by means of fasting and labor; and red martyrdom, enduring death for Christ’s sake” (*Two Lives of Saint Cuthbert: A Life by an Anonymous Monk of Lindisfarne and Bede’s Prose Life*, ed. and trans. by Bertram Colgrave [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985], 315.)

29. Athanasius, *The Life of Anthony and the Letter to Marcellus*, trans. Robert C. Gregg (New York: Paulist Press), 35.

30. *Ibid.*, 69.

31. *The Rule of St. Benedict: the Abingdon Copy*, ed. John Chamberlain (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1982), 18.

32. *Ibid.*, 20.

33. *Ibid.*, 20–21.

34. *Ibid.*, 22.

35. *Two Lives of Saint Cuthbert*, 98.

36. “Athleta, militiae celestis” (*Two Lives*, 180).

37. “At cum ibidem aliquandiu solitarium cum hoste invisibili orando ac ieiunando certeret, tandem maiora presumens, longinquorem ac remotiorem ab hominibus locum certaminis petit.” “But when he had fought there in solitude for some time with the invisible enemy, by prayer and fasting, he sought a place of combat father and more removed from mankind, aiming at greater things” (*Two Lives*, 214, 215).

38. “heremeticæ conversationis agonem” (*Two Lives*, 266).

39. Malone, *Monk*, 90.

40. Monastic profession was regarded as “an irrevocable engagement, making the *conversio* a second baptism, a baptism of repentance, which, differing from the first, remits sin in virtue of the labour of mortification of which it is the beginning” (Leclercq et al, *The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*, 182). See also Malone, *Monk*, 121.

41. Malone, *Monk*, 126.

42. Paul Evdokimov points out: “The Old Slavic word for monk, inok, derives from inoi, meaning ‘other,’ which corresponds well to the symbolism of baptismal rebirth” (*Woman and the Salvation of the World: A Christian Anthropology on the Charisms of Women*, trans. Anthony P. Gythiel [Crestwood NY: St. Vladimir’s Seminary Press, 1994], 106).

43. See *The Heliand: the Saxon Gospel*, trans. by G. Ronald Murphy (New York: Oxford, 1992).

44. *Beowulf*, ed. and trans. Michael Swanton, (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1997), 61.

45. *Ibid.*

46. *Ibid.*, 55.

47. *Ibid.*, p. 95.

48. Eliade, *Myths*, 4.

49. *Ibid.*, 62.
50. Jan de Vries, *Heroic Song and Heroic Legend*, trans. B. J. Timmer (London: 1963), 222. De Vries uses Mircea Eliade's analysis of myth in this analysis of the hero and initiation rituals (pp. 220-26).
51. Elaide, *Rites*, xiv.
52. *Beowulf*, 185.
53. *Ibid.*, 39.
54. *Ibid.*, III.
55. *Ibid.*, 183.
56. *Ibid.*, 185.
57. See "Martyrdom and Monastic Profession as a Second Baptism," in Malone, O.S.B., *Monk*, 112-44.
58. Hope Nash Wolff, *A Study in the Narrative Structure of Three Epic Poems: Gilgamesh, The Odyssey, Beowulf* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1987), 57.
59. Gilmore, *Manhood*, 45.
60. Eliade, *Myths*, 84.
61. See Janet H. Dow's "Beowulf and the 'Walkers in Darkness'" *Connecticut Review* 4 (1970): 42-48.
62. *Beowulf*, 131.
63. *Ibid.*, 95.
64. See Eugene J. Crook, "Pagan Gold in *Beowulf*" *American Benedictine Review* 25 (1974): 218-234.
65. *Beowulf*, 185.
66. For a complete discussion of this topic see "Martyrdom and Monastic Life as a 'Militia Spiritualis'" in Malone, *Monk*, 91-111.
67. The vow mentioned in the Rule of St. Benedict is obedience. Of the other two vows, Cuthbert Butler says "[s]ometimes these two vows have been added . . . but usually they have not been explicitly mentioned," *Benedictine Monachism: Studies in Benedictine Life and Rule* (London: 1919), 123. The three vows became explicit around the twelfth century, but the basic pattern was far older. For Gregory the Great, "[h]umility, continence, and generosity replace pride, lechery, and avarice," Carole Straw, *Gregory the Great: Perfection in Imperfection* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1988), 196.
68. *Summa Theologica* IIa-Iae, Q. 186, Art. 7, Sed Contra., trans. the Fathers of the English Dominican Province (Westminster, Maryland: Christian Classics, 1981).
69. *Rule*, 28-32.
70. *Beowulf*, 117.
71. *Ibid.*, 123.
72. *Ibid.*, 153.
73. *Rule*, 18.
74. *Beowulf*, 91.
75. It may have meant simply *to die* in a pagan context, but in the *Pidreks saga*, Heimir (Hama) enters a monastery.

76. Edsman, *Le Baptême*, 135.

77. *Ibid.*, 153.

78. *Ibid.*, 155.

79. *Beowulf*, 187.

80. Rodney Stark believes that a majority of Christian converts were women. In part, conversion may have been easier for women. Men had public religious duties which were hard to evade. But the modern suspicion that early Christianity was predominantly feminine appears to be largely a presumption that things were as they are now. Stark points to the conversion patterns for “new religious movements in recent times,” but these may be a result of the very feminization I examine (*The Rise of Christianity: A Sociologist Reconsiders History* [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996], 100).

81. Susanne Heine, *Women and Early Christianity: A Reappraisal*, trans. John Bowden (Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1988), 83.

82. Origin, *Contra Celsum* 3.45, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Vol. 4, ed. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson (Henrickson Publishers, Inc., 1995), 482.

83. Heine, *Women*, 94.

84. “Do not women still today convince their husbands to give much offence to God?” quoted by David C. Ford in *Women and Men in the Early Church: The Full Views of St. John Chrysostom* (South Canaan, Pennsylvania: St. Tikhon’s Seminary Press, 1996), 90.

85. Ford, *Women and Men*, 94, 97–98

86. *Ibid.*, 187.

87. John Bugge, *Virginitas: An Essay in the History of a Medieval Idea* (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1975). Bugge collects useful material, but his analysis is flawed by his tendency to see any trace of dualism or exaltation of virginity as “gnostic.” The New Testament, despite its anti-gnosticism, contains a form of dualism and exalts virginity. The Fathers used all their rhetorical powers to praise virginity, because marriage has its obvious attractions, and part of the rhetorical strategy was to appeal to the Platonism that was the common atmosphere of the spirituality of antiquity. The Fathers adopted Platonic language without adopting all the presuppositions of that language.

88. Athanasius, *Apologia ad Constantinum*, 33.49, in *Historical Tracts of S. Athanasius*, trans. John Henry Parker (London: J.G.F. and J. Rivington, 1853), 185. Peter Brown observes that in the West the virgins were female, but in the East, male. See n. 13, *The Body and Society: Men, Women and Sexual Renunciation in Early Christianity* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), 262.

89. “On the Necessity of Guarding Virginity,” quoted by Ford in *Women and Men in the Early Church*, 227.

90. The process started in monasticism, John Climacus wrote “I have watched impure souls mad for physical love but turning what they knew of such love into a reason for penance and transferring that same capacity for love to the Lord.” Quoted by Brown, *The Body and Society*, 238.



6 *The Foundations of Feminization*

1. Despite the prominence of bridal mysticism in medieval and post-medieval spirituality, no one has done a full-scale study. See the article by Pierre Adnes, “Mariage mystique,” in *Dictionnaire de spiritualité, ascétique, et mystique, doctrine et histoire*, vol. 9, (Paris: G. Beauchesne et ses fils, 1937-1995), col. 388-408.

2. Quoted by Jean Leclercq, *Monks and Love in Twelfth Century France: Psycho-Historical Essays* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1979), 52.

3. Bernard of Clairvaux, *On The Song of Songs*, Vol. 1, trans. Kilian Walsh (Spencer, Mass: Cistercian Publications, 1971), 39.

4. *Ibid.*, 86.

5. *Ibid.*, 84. See Bynum, “Jesus as Mother and Abbot as Mother: Some Themes in Twelfth-Century Cistercian Writing,” in *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), 110-169.

6. Bernard, *On the Song*, Vol. 1, 27.

7. Caroline Walker Bynum observes “The male writer who saw his soul as a bride of God or his religious role as womanly submission and humility was conscious of using an image of reversal. He sought reversal because reversal and renunciation were at the heart of a religion whose dominant symbol is the cross—life achieved through death” (“ . . . And Woman His Humanity,” in *Gender and Religion: On The Complexity of Symbols*, ed. Caroline Walker Bynum, Steven Harrell, Paula Richman [Boston: Beacon Press, 1986], 273).

8. R. P. Lawson. “Introduction,” *Origen: The Song of Songs, Commentary and Homilies* (Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, 1957), 6.

9. *Ibid.*, 38.

10. *Ibid.*, 53.

11. Denys Turner sees “pagan neo-Platonism” (*Eros and Allegory: Medieval Exegesis of the Song of Songs*. [Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications, 1995], 32). Eugene S. Maio also sees Platonism, and points to “the lamentable part played by the mystical interpretation of the Canticle of Canticles in assisting the identification of the Eros motif with the Christian idea of Agape” (*St. John of the Cross: The Imagery of Eros* (Madrid: Playor, 1973), 51. Maio follows Anders Nygen (*Eros and Agape*) in finding all human love for God unChristian, but this is bizarre. A feminized Eros is what is objectionable; the Eros (for such it is, if eros is a love for something which a person is not and therefore has not) of friendship, brotherhood, and comradeship between man and Jesus is held up as a model in the Gospel.

12. Nelson Pike, *Mystic Union: An Essay in the Phenomenology of Mysticism* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1992), 68.

13. Origen, *Commentary*, 200.

14. *Ibid.*, 38.

15. Pike, *Mystic Union*, 68.

16. Bynum “Religious Women,” 131.

17. Barbara Newman, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval*

*Religion and Literature* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995), 6.

18. *The Life of Beatrice of Nazareth*, ed. and trans. Roger De Ganck, with the assistance of John Baptist Housbrouck (Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications, 1991), 197.

19. Ernest W. McDonnell, *The Beguines and Beghards in Medieval Culture with Special Emphasis on the Belgian Scene* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1954), 51.

20. Valerie M. Lagorio, “The Continental Women Mystics of the Middle Ages: An Assessment,” in *Roots of the Modern Christian Tradition*, 81. Leclercq et al concur, “It was chiefly among women . . . that the Brautmystik was received with fervor” (*Spirituality of the Middle Ages*, 373).

21. Birgitta explains: “One should know that this most humble handmaid of God never presumed to call herself or have herself called the bride of Christ, or his channel, because of vainglory or transitory honor any temporal advantage, but at the instruction of Christ and of blessed Mary, his most worthy mother, who both called her so” (*Birgitta of Sweden: Life and Selected Revelations*, ed. Marguerite Tjader Harris, trans. Albert Ryle Kezel [New York: Paulist Press, 1990], 71).

22. Leclercq et al., *Spirituality*, 374.

23. Gertrude of Helft, *The Herald of Divine Love*, trans. and ed. Margaret Winckworth (New York: Paulist Press, 1993), 82.

24. *Ibid.*, 95.

25. Hildegard of Bingen, *Symphonia: A Critical Edition of the Symphonia armonie celestium revelationum [Symphony of the Harmony of Celestial Revelations]*, trans. and ed. Barbara Newman (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988), 220.

26. Bridal mysticism is ubiquitous in medieval and post-medieval mystics. In Beatrice of Nazareth it is explicitly erotic and dominant. At her profession, “she sweetly rested in the arms of her spouse” (*Life*, 100). Christ “pressed her soul wholly to himself in the sweetest embrace” (*Life*, 195). She receives communion “as if she were mad with excessive desire” (*Life*, 225).

27. Margaret Ebner, *Major Works*, trans. and ed. by Leonard P Hindsley (New York: Paulist Press, 1993), 156.

28. *Ibid.*, 135.

29. *Ibid.*, 150.

30. *Ibid.*, 122.

31. *Ibid.*, 96.

32. Henry Suso, “The Little Book of Eternal Wisdom,” in *The Exemplar: Life and Writings of Blessed Henry Suso*, Vol. 2, ed. Nicholas Heller, trans. Sister M. Ann Edward (Dubuque, Iowa: The Priory Press, 1962), 6.

33. *Ibid.*, 17.

34. *Ibid.*, 19.

35. *Ibid.*, 36.

36. *Ibid.*, 98.

37. *Ibid.*, 231.

38. Ibid., 98.

39. Ibid., 242, 253.

40. Ibid., 343.

41. For a study of the use of the bridal metaphor by these two Carmelites, see Elizabeth Teresa Howe, *Mystical Imagery: Santa Teresa de Jesús and San Juan de la Cruz* (New York: Peter Lang, 1987), esp. 161–169. For both saints, “spiritual marriage symbolizes the culmination of the mystic’s quest” (Ibid., 168). The conformity to God is not the Scriptural image of being conformed to the Son, but in John of the Cross’s phrase, “Amada en el Amado transformada.”

42. Turner, *Eros and Agape*, 25.

43. David Herlihy writes: “There is...a body of scattered but consistent comment which indicates that between the early and late Middle Ages, women had gained a superiority over men in life expectancy” (“Life Expectancies for Women in Medieval Society” in *The Role of Women in the Middle Ages*, ed. Rosemarie Morewedge [Albany: State University of New York, 1975], 11). The climate had improved in the high Middle Ages, when grain could even be grown in Iceland, and improved food supplies may have helped women more than men, because pregnancy made women more susceptible to the consequences of malnutrition.

44. See Herbert Grundmann, *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages*, trans. by Stephen Rowan (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995), esp. 75–88. See also R. W. Southern, *Western Society and Church on the Middle Ages* (Harmondsworth, Penguin Books, 1970), 318–331, and Ernest W. McDonnell, “Social Origins: The *Frauenfrage*,” in *The Beguines and Beghards in Medieval Culture with Special Emphasis on the Belgian Scene* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1954), 81–100.

45. Stephen E. Wessley, “The Thirteenth-Century Guglielmites: Salvation through Women,” in *Medieval Women*, 289.

46. Southern, *Western Society*, 314.

47. Sally Thompson, “The Problem of the Cistercian Nuns” in *Medieval Women*, ed. Derek Baker (Oxford: Blackwell: 1978), 240.

48. “Dominus a nobis uxores abstuli, dyabolus autem nobis procurat sorores” (quoted by Grundmann, *Bewegungen*, 262, f. 149). Somehow this quote was omitted from the English translation, *Religious Movements*.

49. The decision reads “prohibemus ne aliquis fratrum nostrorum de cetero laboret vel procuret, ut cura vel custodia monialium seu quarumlibet aliarum mulierum nostris fratribus committantur” (we prohibit either to labor or to seek out that the care or custody of nuns or of any other women be committed to our brothers) (quoted by Roger De Ganck, *Beatrice of Nazareth in Her Context* [Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1991], 21, note 89).

50. Grundmann says of Dominic: “On his deathbed, in his last conversations on the order, he pressingly warned his brethren against association with women, particularly with young women. Was he only warning against the moral attitude of individual friars? Is it possible that the founder, preoccupied with questions about the future of his order in these last utterances, had been discussing whether the order should incor-

porate further women's communities, placing friars to oversee and supply them, withdrawing from the order's primary duty of preaching?" (*Religious Movements*, 94-95).

51. According to Grundmann, "The women themselves sought to join the large orders, and the curia was concerned to make this possible; the orders, however, fought it, trying by all means available to avoid the obligation of receiving and administering women's communities" (*Religious Movements*, 90).

52. Grundmann, *Religious Movements*, 98.

53. Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M. Bell state: "Among Benedictines, however, very few women were celebrated as saintly. Of the 134 Benedictine saints in our sample, 106 died in the eleventh and twelfth century, and of this latter figure only 11 percent were women" (*Saints and Society: Christendom, 1000-1700* [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977], 223).

54. Weinstein and Bell, *Saints*, 223.

55. Joan Coackley, "Friars, Sanctity, and Gender: Mendicant Encounters with Saints 1250-1325" in *Medieval Masculinities*, ed. Clare A. Lees (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994) 92.

56. André Vauchez has analyzed the processes for canonization and the canonizations in the Latin church. His figures show a shift from the twelfth to the fourteenth century in the ratio of lay men to lay women. From 1198 to 1431, 55.5 per cent of the canonization of lay Christian were of women, and 44.5 of men. However, "parmi les procès de canonisation de saints laïcs, 50% au XIIIe siècle concernent des femmes contre 71.4% au cours de la période ultérieure. Après 1305, les laïcs dont la sainteté est reconnue par l'Eglise appartiennent deux fois sur trois au sexe faible (among the processes of canonization for lay saints, 50% in the thirteenth century concerned women as opposed to 71.4% during the course of the later period. After 1395 the saints whose sanctity was recognized by the Church belonged two out of three times to the weaker sex)." Vauchez continues that the Curia canonized women recommended by the mendicant orders, and that "La sainteté laïque masculine. . . disparaît complètement de l'horizon de la Curie" (Lay masculine sanctity disappeared completely from the horizon of the Curia) (*La Sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du moyen âge* [Rome: Ecole Française de Rome: 1981], 317).

57. Anne K. Warren, "English anchoritism was already biased toward women in the twelfth century. It became sharply female in orientation in the thirteenth century" (*Anchorites and Their Patrons in Medieval England* [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985], 20). Female anchorites were always more common than male anchorites in England, although Warren notes that the proportion of men increased toward the Reformation.

58. Caroline Walker Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), 14.

59. Jean Leclercq, "Introduction: The Roots of Modernity," in *The Spirituality of Western Christendom*, Vol. 2: *The Roots of the Western Tradition*, ed. E. Rozanne Elder (Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, Inc., 1984), xiii.

60. Berthold von Regensburg preached: "Ir frouwen, ir sît barmherzic unde gêt

gerner zuo kirchen danne die man unde sprechet iuwer gebete gerner danne die man unde gêt zu predigen gerner danne die man” (*Predigten*, Vol. 1, ed. Franz Pfeiffer [Vienna: Wilhelm Braumüller, 1862], 41). In another sermon, Berthold continues in the same vein, and says that women are “erbaumherziger, danne die man und betet gerner, mit venie, mit danne die man, mit kirchgengen, mit riuwe, mit ûf stên, mit salter lesen, mit vigilie. Mit maniger guottæte sît ir bezzer (More merciful than men and more willing to pray with prostrations than men, with visits to church, with quiet, with standing, with reading the Psalter, with vigils. With many good deeds are you better) (*Predigten*, Vol. 2, 141).

61. Jean Leclercq, Francois Vandenbroucke and Louis Bouyer, *The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*, trans. The Benedictines of Holmes Eden Abbey (London: Burns and Oates: 1968), 225.

62. *Ibid.*, 242.

63. Aristotle, *Metaphysics* 1055b, 25-29 in *The Complete World of Aristotle*, Vol. 1, ed. Jonathan Barnes (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984), 1667.

64. Aristotle, *Generation of Animals*, 738b in *The Complete World of Aristotle*, Vol. 1, ed. Jonathan Barnes (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984), 1146.

65. Prudence Allen, *The Concept of Women: The Aristotelian Revolution 750 BC-AD 1250*. (1985. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1997), 383.

66. Anne W. Astell, *The Song of Songs in the Middle Ages* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1990), 13.

67. Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, 172.

### 7 Feminized Christianity

1. Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, Vol. 3, 2, *The Doctrine of Creation*, 54.1, trans. Harold Knight et al. (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1960), 175.

2. Manfred Hauke, *God or Goddess? Feminist Theology: What Is It? Where Does It Lead?* trans. David Kipp (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1995), 135-36.

3. Hauke, *Women in the Priesthood?, A Systematic Analysis in the Light of the Order Creation and Redemption*, trans. David Kipp (1986. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1988) 304. He concurs with Hans Urs von Balthasar who claims “every member of the Church, even the priest, must maintain a feminine receptivity to the Lord of the Church” (*New Elucidations*, trans. Mary Theresilde Skerry [San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1986], 198).

4. F. X. Arnold, *Woman and Man: Their Nature and Mission* (New York: Herder and Herder, 1963), 54-55.

5. *Ibid.*, 55-56.

6. George T. Montague, *Our Father, Our Mother: Mary and the Faces of God*. Steubenville, Ohio: Franciscan University Press, 1990), 85.

7. Peter Toon, *Let Women Be Women: Equality, Ministry and Ordination* (Gracewing: Leominster: Fowler Wright Books, 1990), 100.

8. William Hood, *Fra Angeliko at San Marco* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 21.
9. *Ibid.*, p. 22.
10. Brother Antoninus (William O. Everson), “Annul in Me My Manhood,” in *The Crooked Lines of God* (Detroit: University of Detroit Press, 1962), 86–87.
11. Juli Loesch Wiley, “In Defense of God the Father,” in Helen Hull Hitchcock, ed., *The Politics of Prayer: Feminist Language and the Worship of God* (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1992), 319.
12. Amanda Porterfield writes: “Puritans defined grace as a kind of intercourse between God and the saint that signified the saint’s espousal to God and thereby her salvation, and they sometimes pictured this intercourse in a way that aroused erotic feelings that could be interpreted as the stirrings of grace” (*Female Piety in Puritan New England: The Emergence of Religious Humanism* [New York: Oxford University Press, 1992], 14).
13. Edward Pearse, *The Best Match; or the Souls Espousal to Christ, opened and improved* (London, 1673), 33.
14. Cotton Mather, *Ornaments for the Daughters of Zion* (Boston, 1691), 63.
15. Cotton Mather, *A Glorious Espousal* (Boston, 1719), 11.
16. Quoted by Amanda Porterfield, *Feminine Spirituality in America: From Sarah Edwards to Martha Graham* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1980), 24.
17. Quoted by Richard Godbeer, “‘Love Raptures’: Marital, Romantic, and Erotic Images of Jesus Christ in Puritan New England, 1670–1730,” *New England Quarterly* 68 (1990): 366.
18. Thomas Hooker, *The Soul’s Exaltation: A Treatise Concerning the Soul’s Union with Christ, the Souls Benefit from Union with Christ, the Souls Justification* (London, 1648) quoted in Moller, “Sex Composition, and Correlated Culture Patterns of Colonial America” *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd series, 2 (1945): 150.
19. “Meditation. Cant. 4.8. My Spouse,” in Donald E. Stanford, ed., *The Poems of Edward Taylor*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1960), 39.
20. “Meditation. Can. 1.2. Let him kiss me with the Kisses of his mouth,” *Poems*, 257.
21. “Meditation. Cant.5.13. His Lips are like Lillies, dropping sweet smelling Myrrh.” *Poems*, 303.
22. See Godbeer, “Love Raptures,” 355–384.
23. Porterfield, *Feminine Spirituality*, 29–30.
24. Jonathan Edwards quoted in Perry Miller’s “Jonathan Edwards’ Sociology of the Great Awakening,” *New England Quarterly* 21 (1948): 68.
25. Bill McCartney, “God is Calling Us to a Higher Love,” in *Go the Distance: The Making of a Promise Keeper*, ed. John Trent (Colorado Springs, Colorado: Focus on the Family Publishing, 1996), 13.
26. Alphonsus de Ligouri, *The True Spouse of Jesus Christ*, trans. and ed. Eugene Grimm (1929. Rockford, IL; Tan Books, n.d.), 18. Alphonsus quotes the patristic justification for this usage, but he denigrates marriage in a way that would have aroused

the suspicion of the anti-Gnostic propagandists among the Fathers. Christians seem unable to praise marriage without denigrating virginity (the fault of Luther) or to praise virginity without denigrating marriage. Since most Christians marry, and since almost all Christians have several years in which they must practice chastity before marriage, everyone has a chance to feel he is living in an impossible spiritual state.

27. Juan González Arintero, *The Song of Songs: A Mystical Exposition, with a preface by Alberto Colunga*, trans. James Valender and Jose L. Morales (Rockford Il: Tan Books, 1992), 21.

28. *Ibid.*, 8.

29. *Ibid.*, 22.

30. See Karl Barth, above, xxx.

31. Hauke, *Women in the Priesthood?*, 338.

32. *Ibid.*, 94. Hauke, it must be admitted, says this in the context of women's greater integration of personality, a characterization of femininity that is closer to the

33. *Ibid.*, 300.

34. Ron Hansen has used this eroticized spirituality as the basis for his novel, *Mariette in Ecstasy* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, Harper Perennial, 1991). Mariette, a (fraudulent?) stigmatist, moves in a conventual world of pain and sexuality. She is taught "We know from Church teaching that the soul has no true pleasure but in love. And we know from our experience that extreme bliss can only come from extreme passion" (*ibid.*, 60). The nuns enact a play based on the *Songs of Songs* (*ibid.*, 82-85). After she is stigmatized, her confessor wonders "And why are there so many women and so few men?" who are stigmatists (*ibid.*, 127). Mariette dreams (?) she is being raped (by whom? the devil?) (*ibid.*, 145). Mariette dreams of talking with Christ, and she sleeps with him: "And I share in him as if he's inside me. And he is" (*ibid.*, 168). All this is only a slight distortion of the eroticized spirituality held up as a model for sanctity from the Middle Ages to the present.

35. Barbara Newman, *From Virile Woman to Woman Christ: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995), 138. Bynum also observes: "religious males had a problem. If the God with whom they wished to unite was spoken of in male language, it was hard to use the metaphor of sexual union unless they saw themselves as female" (Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982], 161) which some of them did: "We also have many examples of monks describing themselves or their souls as the bride of Christ" (Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, 161).

36. Brenda E. Basher speculates about the fundamentalist churches she studied: "both the emphasis on religious experiences in the female enclaves and the dearth of religious experiences in overall congregational life may be an entailment of each group's gender habits with its theological and social ideals rather than a consequence of gender-based social power conflicts. The male-imagined deity and heterosexual norms create an environment in which women who seek religious experience are actually performing their gender, while men perform theirs by declining to pursue such conduct" (*Godly Women: Fundamentalism and Female Power* [New Brunswick, New Jersey,

1998], 122). Basher assumes, as the fundamentalists may also assume, that “religious experience” is innately erotic, and therefore for men it would have homosexual overtones, because the Deity is male.

37. *The Cistercian World: Monastic Writings of the Twelfth Century*, trans. and ed. by Paul Matarasso (New York: Penguin Books, 1993), 145.

38. Gertrude of Helfta, *The Herald of Divine Love*, trans. and ed. Margaret Winkworth (New York: Paulist Press, 1993), 115.

39. *Ibid.*, 117.

40. *Ibid.*

41. Ulinka Roblack, “Female Spirituality and the Infant Jesus in Late Medieval Dominican Convents,” *Gender and History* 6 (1994): 41.

42. *Ibid.*, 43.

43. Margaret Ebner, *Major Works*, trans. and ed. Leonard P. Hindsley (New York: Paulist Press 1993), 134.

44. *Ibid.*

45. Roblack, “Female Spirituality,” 46, 50.

46. Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, 110–159.

47. Julian of Norwich, *The Revelation of Divine Love in Sixteen Showings*, trans. M. L. del Mastro (Ligouri, Missouri: Ligouri Publications, 1994), 172.

48. *Ibid.*, 168.

49. Gertrude, *Herald*, 211.

50. *Ibid.*, 47.

51. *The Autobiography of Saint Margaret Mary Alacoque*, trans. The Sisters of the Visitation (Rockford, Il: Tan Books and Publishers, 1986), 41.

52. *Ibid.*, 40.

53. *Ibid.*, 62.

54. *Ibid.*, 67.

55. *Ibid.*, 82.

56. José de Vinck, *Revelations of Women Mystics From the Middle Ages to Modern Times* (New York: Alba House, 1985), 87–88

57. *Ibid.*, 160.

58. *Ibid.*, 165.

59. Catherine of Siena, *The Dialogue*, trans. Suzanne Noffke (New York: Paulist Press, 1980), 64.

60. Liege was dominated by feminine spirituality. Miri Rubin observes of men such as Jacques de Vitry and Jacques Pantaléon, the future Urban IV: “The men witnessed the spirituality of their female neighbors or charges and compared it with their own; some extraordinary friendships were struck between monks and beguines, and this mutual fascination was to develop further when the mendicant and beguine communities were to meet in the thirteenth century” (*Corpus Christi: The Eucharist in Late Medieval Culture* [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993], 167).

61. Caroline Walker Bynum, *Holy Feasts and Holy Fasts: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987).



62. Miri Rubin writes: “narratives of encounter with a child in the host dominated the fantasies of women, especially by those attached to the eucharist. These could be violent and pathetic like Jane Mary of Maillé’s (d. 1414) vision of a wounded child elevated in the host. It could also be deeply loving: Agnes of Montepulciano (d. 1317) and Margaret of Faenza (d. 1330) were each so intoxicated with the baby they saw they refused to give it up, and Ida of Louvain played with the child revealed to her” (*Corpus Christi*, 344).

63. Of St. Catherine of Genoa it was said in the *Spiritual Dialogues*, “No priest or friar objected to this need, the daily reception of the Blessed Sacrament, for such was the will of God” (Catherine of Genoa, *Purgation and Purgatory, the Spiritual Dialogue*, trans. Serge Hughes [New York: Paulist Press, 1979], 110).

64. *Hadewijch: The Complete Works*, trans. Columba Hart (New York: Paulist Press, 1980), 280–281. For a discussion of this passage, see Caroline Bynum, *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on the Human Body in Medieval Mysticism* (New York: Zone Books, 1991), 119–20.

65. Rubin, *Corpus Christi*, 169.

66. Peter Dinzelbacher, *Vision und Visionliteratur im Mittelalter* (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann: 1981) 226; see also 229 and Elizabeth A. Petroff’s *Medieval Women’s Visionary Literature* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), esp. 5–20.

67. Jean Leclercq, “It was, then, among the Béguines of the thirteenth century... that the first evidence of the Wesenmystik is found” (*The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*, trans. the Benedictines of Holmes Eden Abbey [1961. London, Burns and Oates, 1968], 377).

68. Leclercq, *Spirituality*, 357. These religious women also showed a contempt for the hierarchy and an indifference to the sacraments, as well as moral license.

69. Jacques Le Goff writes, “Purgatory made even more impressive headway with the populace than it did with theologians and clergy” (*The Birth of Purgatory*, trans. Arthur Goldhammer [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984], 289).

70. Newman, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist*, 109.

71. Margaret Ebner, *Major Works*, 87–88.

72. Julian, *Revelation*, 108.

73. *Ibid.*, 109.

74. Gertrude, *Herald*, 66.

75. *Ibid.*, 61.

76. *Ibid.*, 69.

77. Catherine of Genoa, *Purgation and Purgatory*, 75.

78. Quoted by Friedrich von Hügel, *The Mystical Element in Religion as Studied in Catherine of Genoa and Her Friends*, Vol. 1 (London: M. Dents and Sons, 1927), 283.

79. Hans Urs von Balthasar, *Dare We Hope ‘That All Men Be Saved’?* with a *Short Discourse on Hell*, trans. David Kripp and Lothar Krauth (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1988).

80. *Ibid.*, 97–113.

81. Ibid., 99.
82. Ibid., 111.
83. Moller, “Sex Composition” 146.
84. K. E. Schmöger, *The Life of Anne Catherine Emmerich*, Vol. I (Rockford, IL: Tan Books and Publishers, Inc., 1976), 195.
85. Ibid., 196.
86. Marina Warner, “Blood and Tears,” *New Yorker* 72:7 (8 April 1996): 69. E. Michael Jones, editor of *Fidelity*, has made a career of exposing false revelations, or at least ones he has decided are false. Women figure prominently in them.
87. Ibid., 65.
88. Ong, *Fighting for Life*, 170.
89. Ibid., 170–171.
90. Ibid., 139.
91. Schindler, *Heart of the Church, Heart of the World: Communio Ecclesiology, Liberalism, and Liberation* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1996), 242. See also Hans Urs von Balthasar, *Theodramatik*, Vol. 4, *Das Endspiel* (Einsiedeln: Johannes Verlag, 1983), 80.
92. David Martin, *A Sociology of English Religion* (London: SCM Press Ltd, 1967), 127.
93. Terman and Miles, *Sex and Personality*, 117.
94. Paula D. Nesbitt, *Feminization of the Clergy in America: Occupational and Organizational Perspectives* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997).
95. Ibid., 160. Nesbitt notes that “Conservative Protestant denominations have been less affected by a declining supply of young men.” (ibid., 104).
96. In Hauke’s critique of feminist theology in *God or Goddess*, it is clear that women are irked by the identification of women and obedience, and the consequent special duty of women to obey to avoid being “unnatural,” that is, unfeminine. Feminists therefore often reject both obedience and the concept of a binding revelation.
97. Kaye Ashe, *The Feminization of the Church?* (Kansas City: Sheed and Ward, 1997). 25.
98. Ibid., 32.
99. Ibid., 37.
100. Ibid., 39.
101. Ibid., 40.

## 8 Countercurrents

1. Bernard of Clairvaux, *Treatises III: On Grace and Free Choice; In Praise of the New Knighthood*, trans. Daniel O’Donovan and Conrad Greenia (Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications Inc., 1977).
2. Ibid., 134.
3. Ibid.

4. Ibid., 135.

5. Ibid.

6. Simone Roison writes: “C’est à la Vierge que va l’affection sensible des moines comme l’amour ardent des moniales tend vers le Christ eucharistique, l’Époux céleste” (It is to the Virgin that the devotion of the senses of the monks was directed as the ardent love of the nuns tended to the Eucharistic Christ, the heavenly Bridegroom) (Simone Roisin, *L’Hagiographie cistercienne dans le diocèse de Liège au XIIIe siècle*. [Louvain: Bibliothèque de l’Université, 1947], 115).

7. Caroline Walker Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982).

8. Hilda Graef, *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion*. Two volumes in one. (1963. Westminster, Maryland: Christian Classics, 1985), 241.

9. Ibid., 289.

10. Graef quotes Bernadine of Siena: “one Hebrew woman invaded the house of the eternal King; one girl, I do not know by what caresses, pledge or violence, seduced, deceived and, if I may say so, wounded and enraptured the divine heart and ensnared the Wisdom of God” (*Mary*, Vol. 1, 317).

11. Ibid., 295–296. See also Prudence Allen, *The Concept of Women: The Aristotelian Revolution 750 BC - AD 1250* (1985. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1997), 376–383.

12. Ibid., 297.

13. Graef again quotes Bernadine of Siena that Mary “has added certain perfections to the Maker of the universe” (*Mary*, Vol. 1, 317).

14. Ibid., 41.

15. Quoted, Ibid., 117.

16. *The Documents of Vatican II* (New York: Herder and Herder, 1966) ed. Walter J. Abbott, 95.

17. Leo Steinberg, *The Sexuality of Christ in Renaissance Art and Modern Oblivion* (London: Faber and Faber Limited, 1984).

18. Robert Harvey, *Ignatius Loyola: A General in the Church Militant* (Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing Co. 1936), 182.

19. Heinrich Boehmer, *The Jesuits: An Historical Study*, trans. Paul Zeller Strodach, (Philadelphia: The Castle Press, 1928), 40.

20. Quoted by Harvey, *Ignatius*, 192.

21. Ignatius wrote of himself: “Up to the age of twenty-six, he was a man given to the vanities of the world; and what he enjoyed most was warlike sport, with a great and foolish desire to win fame” (*Autobiography, in Ignatius of Loyola: Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, ed. George E. Ganss [New York: Paulist Press, 1991], 68).

22. Ignatius, *Autobiography*, 77. Robert Harvey finds it natural to give his biography (above) chapter headings such as “The Setting for the First Struggle,” “The Call to Arms,” “The First Recruits,” “The Manual of Discipline,” “The Articles of War,” “The Campaign Against Heresy,” and with a modern touch, “The Baptism of Fire.”

23. Ibid., 74.

24. Ignatius uses the image in such passages as “in Christ the Lord, the bridegroom, and in His spouse the Church” (*Exercises*, 160).

25. Ignatius, *Exercises*, 145. Ignatius also compares Satan to “a woman” because he “is a weakling before a show of strength, and a tyrant if he has his will” (*Exercises*, 145).

26. Ibid., 43.

27. Ibid., 44.

28. Ibid., 60.

29. Quoted by Harvey, *Ignatius*, 149.

30. Alice Corbin Henderson, *Brothers of Light: The Penitentes of the Southwest* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1937), 105.

31. Andre Vauchez notes “the Crusades illustrate the birth of a new religious sensibility within Western Christianity: what is known as ‘penitential spirituality’ (*The Laity in the Middle Ages: Religious Beliefs and Devotional Practices*, ed. Daniel E. Boorstein, trans. Margery J. Schneider [Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 1993] 49).

32. In a foreshadowing of later conflicts, “when the master-general of the Dominican Order imposed the *Regola dei fratelli e delle sorore della penitenza di S. Dominico* on the confraternities affiliated with the Dominicans, thereby making the admission of members subject to the authorization of the Dominicans, the male members withdrew. And is it not the case that the only noteworthy members of these pious congregations in the fourteenth century were women, *mantellate* like St. Catherine of Siena and Maria of Venice?” (Vauchez, *Laity*, 115).

33. Vauchez, *Laity*, 123.

34. “Women were excluded from them for obvious reasons” (Ibid., 123).

35. Vauchez, *Laity*, 127.

36. Stanley Brandes, *Metaphors of Masculinity: Sex and Status in Andalusian Folklore* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 1980), 201.

37. Ibid., 201–202.

38. Ibid., 202.

39. Christopher J. Kauffman, *Faith and Fraternalism: The History of the Knights of Columbus 1882–1982* (New York: Harper and Row, 1982), 124.

40. Basil Pennington, “The Cistercians” in *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Thirteenth Century*, ed. Bernard McGinn and John Meyendorff (Crossroad: New York: 1986), 216.

41. Christine E. Gudorf describes the situation of the Church at the beginning of Vatican II: “as the Church lost ground to liberalism in attempting to retain its former niche in the world, it shifted the grounds of religion’s defense from the public political sphere to the private domestic sphere. This reinforced religion’s feminine image by suggesting that there was indeed a special connection between religion and the feminine domestic sphere” (“Renewal or Repatriarchalization: Responses of the Roman Catholic Church to the Feminization of Religion,” *Horizons* 10 [1982]: 234).

42. Ibid., 251.
43. Patrick M. Arnold, *Wildmen, Warriors, and Kings: Masculine Spirituality in the Bible* (Crossroad: New York, 1991), 77.
44. Richard Rohr, "Introduction," in David C. James, *What Are They Saying About Masculine Spirituality?* (New York: Paulist Press, 1996), 3.
45. Peter N. Stearns, *Be a Man! Males in Modern Society*, 2nd ed. (New York: Holmes and Meier, 1990), 39.
46. Paul Tillich, *Systematic Theology*, Vol. 3 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1963), 313.
47. Marc Leinhard, "Luther and the Beginnings of the Reformation," in *Christian Spirituality: High Middle Ages and Reformation*, ed. Jill Raitt (New York: Crossroad, 1987), 293.
48. Heiko A. Oberman, *Luther: Man Between God and the Devil*, trans. Eileen Walliser-Schwarzbart (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989), 104.
49. Merry Weisner, "Luther and Women: The Death of Two Marys" in *Disciplines of Faith: Studies in Religion, Politics, and Patriarchy*, ed. Jim Obelkevich, Lyndal Roper, and Raphael Samuël (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987), 103.
50. André Bieler, *L'homme et la femme dans la morale calviniste* (Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1963), 36, 48-49.
51. Gail Malmgreen, "Domestic Discords: Women and the Family in East Cheshire Methodism, 1750-1830" in *Disciplines of Faith*, 60.
52. Herbert Moller, "Sex Composition and Correlated Cultural Patterns of Colonial America," *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd series, 2 (1945): 152.
53. Winthrop S. Hudson, *American Protestantism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press), 78.
54. David W. Kling, *A Field of Divine Wonders: The New Divinity and Village Revivals in Northwestern Connecticut 1792 -1822* (University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1993), 14.
55. Marc C. Carnes, *Secret Ritual and Manhood in Early America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989), 72.
56. Gerald F. Moran, "Christian Revivalism in Early America" *Modern Christian Revivals*, ed. Edith L. Blumhofer and Randall Balmer (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993), 52-53.
57. Ibid., 53. Terry D. Bilhartz observed that in the early nineteenth century "revivalistic Methodist and belatedly evangelistic Presbyterian congregations slowed the feminization process of Baltimore's religious institutions" (*Urban Religion and the Second Great Awakening: Church and Society in Early National Baltimore* [Rutherford, New Jersey: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1986], 97).
58. Jonathan Edwards had delivered a sermon on the same theme in the earlier part of the century: "It is surprising and almost amazing to hear what a swift pass the nation has got to in the present day, and what a swift progress Deism and heresies have lately made in this nation. Those that deny all revealed religion, that deny Scripture to be the word of God, that deny all the gospel, deny that Christ was anything but

a mean cheat, and deny all that is said about the way of salvation by him, they are vastly multiplied as of late years, yea, even as to threaten to swallow up the nation, and to root the very name of Christianity out of it; they are become the very fashionable sort of men (quoted by Perry Miller, “Jonathan Edward’s Sociology of the Great Awakening,” *New England Quarterly* 21 (1948): 54-55.

59. Kling, *A Field of Divine Wonders*, 10.

60. *Ibid.*, 170.

61. Kling writes: “The large percentage of married men converted and then admitted to Church membership, either simultaneously with their wives or following their wives’ conversion, suggests that for many males, conversion came at the behest of their spouses” (*A Field of Divine Wonders*, 217).

62. *The Christian Advocate*, March 4, 1858, quoted by Richard Carwardine, *Transatlantic Revivalism* (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1978), 169.

63. Marion L. Bell, *Crusade in the City: Revivalism in Nineteenth Century Philadelphia* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 1978), 169.

64. Jay P. Dolan, *Catholic Revivalism: the American Expedience 1830 - 1900* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1978), 121.

65. See Norman Vance, *The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985).

66. *Ibid.*, 16.

67. Charles Kingsley: *His Letters and His Age*, Vol. 1. (London: Henry S. King and Co., 1877), 204.

68. *Ibid.*, 204.

69. David Rosen writes: “For Kingsley, the ideal of self-actualization, the fulfillment of manly potential, becomes a moral imperative” (“The volcano and the cathedral: muscular Christianity and the origins of primal manliness” in Donald E. Hall, ed., *Muscular Christianity: Embodying the Victorian Age* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 35.

70. Charles Kingsley: *His Letters*, Vol. 1, 399.

71. Quoted by Laura Fasick, “Charles Kingsley’s Scientific Treatment of Gender,” in *Muscular Christianity*, 93.

72. Vance, *The Sinews*, 3.

73. *Ibid.*, 17-26.

74. Gail Bederman, “‘The Women Have Had Charge of the Church Work Long Enough’: The Men and Religion Forward Movement of 1911 - 1912 and the Masculinization of Middle-Class Protestantism,” *American Quarterly* 41 (1989): 444.

75. Bederman summarizes: “According to Census figures, in 1906 the Protestant churches, combined, had been 39.5 percent male. By 1926, the proportion had grown 6.3 percent to 41.8 percent male. Some denominations...has gained even more new men. For example, the proportion of men in Congregational churches grew by 10.9 percent. In the Northern Presbyterian (U. S. A.) churches, male membership was up by 11.2 percent. The proportion of Episcopalian men grew by a whopping 20.8 per-

cent” (“Men and Religion,” 454). Indeed, reports in 1925 were that “male converts had nearly equaled female converts during the past several years” (ibid., 455) although the previous state of the church persisted: “Protestant churches still had more women than men.” (ibid., 454).

76. Bruce Barton, *The Man Nobody Knows: A Discovery of the Real Jesus* (Indianapolis: Bobbs Merrill Co., 1925), 28.

77. Ibid., 69.

78. Ibid., 40–41.

79. Ibid., 42–43.

80. Ibid., 121.

81. Ibid., 179. Other writers have pointed to this dichotomy as a source of masculine discomfort with religion. Martin W. Pable writes: “Unfortunately, most Christian men I know don’t think their job has anything to do with their spiritual life” and quotes Pope Paul VI: “one of the greatest evils of our time is the separation of religion from the rest of life” (*A Man and His God* [Notre Dame: Ave Maria Press, 1988], 59).

82. Ibid., 179.

83. Ibid., 180.

84. Harry Emerson Fosdick, *The Manhood of the Master* (New York: Association Press, 1913), 116.

85. Ibid., 41.

86. Ibid., 88.

87. Margaret Lamberts Bendroth, *Fundamentalism and Gender: 1875 to the Present* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 64.

88. Bendroth notes that by the 1940s “the overrepresentation of women in the movement’s rank and file visibly contradicted the claim that orthodoxy was a masculine reserve, setting off fears of feminization that had been part of the fundamentalist ethos since its earliest stages” (*Fundamentalism*, 90).

89. Bendroth, *Fundamentalism*, 19.

90. Goldwert, “Machismo and Christ: The New Formula” *Contemporary Review* 145 (1984): 185.

91. Ibid., 185.

92. Pope John Paul II likes the substance of Saint Louis Marie Grignon de Montfort’s *Treatise of True Devotion to the Blessed Virgin*, but admits that the book “can be a bit disconcerting, given its rather florid and baroque style” (*Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordination* [New York: Doubleday, 1996], 29).

### 9 Masculinity as Religion: Transcendence and Nihilism

1. Gail Bederman writes of the influence of the popular press of Theodore Roosevelt’s time: “middle-class constructions of male power would become firmly based on the violence and sexuality of his journalistic version of primitive masculinity” (*Man-*

*liness and Civilization: A Cultural History of Gender and Race in the United States, 1880-1917* [Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995], 215). Sports became more violent at the end of the nineteenth and the beginning of the twentieth centuries.

2. Charles Pickstone, *The Divinity of Sex: The Search for Ecstasy in a Secular Age* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996), 175.

3. *Ibid.*, 3, 175.

4. G. Stanley Hall, *Adolescence, Its Psychology and Its Relation to Physiology, Anthropology, Sociology, Sex, Crime, Religion, and Education*, vol. 2 (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1911), 292-293.

5. Bederman, *Manliness and Civilization*, 104. George Albert Coe notes "a connection between adolescent conversions and the sexual instinct" (*The Psychology of Religion* [Chicago, University of Chicago Press: 1916], 163).

6. Hall, *Adolescence*, vol. 2, 123.

7. For an analysis of Lawrence's sacralization of sexuality, see Pickstone, *Divinity of Sex*, 62-65.

8. Elliot J. Gorn writes: "Sports taught manliness in a violent world. All that was feminine, sentimental, or romantic - and many late nineteenth-century writers worried aloud that America had become "womanized" - was expunged on athletic fields of battle" (*The Manly Art: Bare-Knuckle Prize Fighting in America* [Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986], 189).

9. Donald J. Mrozek, *Sports and American Mentality 1880-1910* (Knoxville, University of Tennessee Press, 1983), 233.

10. John Carroll, "Sport: Virtue and Grace," *Theory, Culture, and Society* 3, no. 1 (1986): 93.

11. *Ibid.*, 94.

12. Michael A. Messner, *Power at Play: Sports and the Problem of Masculinity* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1992), 87.

13. Quoted in J. A. Mangan, *Athleticism in the Victorian and Edwardian Public School: The Emergence and Consolidation of an Educational Ideology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 9.

14. *Ibid.*, 196.

15. Carroll, "Sport," 97.

16. *Ibid.*

17. Michael Novak writes: "sports flow outward into action from a deep natural impulse that is radically religious: an impulse of freedom, respect for ritual limits, a zest for symbolic meaning, and a longing for perfection" (*The Joy of Sports: End Zones, Bases, Baskets, Balls, and the Consecration of the American Spirit* rev. ed. [1967. Lanham, Maryland: Madison Books, 1994], 19).

18. Charles S. Prebish, "Religion and Sport: Convergence or Identity?" *Religion and Sport: The Meeting of Sacred and Profane Religion and Sport* (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1993) ed. Charles S. Prebish, 63.

19. *Ibid.*, 63.

20. Howard Slushier, "Sport and the Religious," in *Religion and Sport*, 178.



21. Michael Novak, *The Joy of Sports*, 5.
22. Willaim J. Morgan, “An Existential, Phenomenological Analysis of Sport as a Religious Experience” in *Religion and Sport*, 132.
23. Quoted *Ibid.*, 131.
24. D. Stanley Eitzen and George H. Sage, “Sport and Religion” in *Religion and Sport*, 96.
25. Brian W. W. Anderson asked Christian athletes whether they had any psychological high or any sense of God’s presence when they played, “And in every interview the answer was the same, a categorical ‘no’; sports can be fun and a very significant part of their lives but it is more like work than religion” (“The Emergence of Born-Again Sport,” in *Religion and Sport*, 209).
26. Alan M. Klein analyzes this reaction: “the weakness that lives at the core of so many bodybuilders, and the vulnerability they struggle to overcome, is responsible for the elaboration of a lifestyle that brooks no weakness or vulnerability” (*Little Big Men: Bodybuilding Subculture and Gender Construction* [Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993], 19).
27. Sam Fussell, *Muscle: Confessions of an Unlikely Bodybuilder* (1991. New York: Avon Books, 1992), 85.
28. Klein, *Little Big Men*, 40.
29. The resemblances between bodybuilding and fascism that Klein detects (“Body, Fascist Imagery, and Masculinity” in *Little Big Men*, 253-264) are the sense of powerlessness and victimization that leads to the pursuit of power and hardness as means of protection.
30. Ryszard Kapuski, *The Soccer War* (1977. Random House, Inc., Vintage International, 1986), 182.
31. Michael Bane, *Over the Edge: A Regular Guy’s Odyssey in Extreme Sports* (New York: Macmillan, 1996), 187.
32. *Ibid.*, 190.
33. Rob Schultheis, *Bone Games: Extreme Sports, Shamanism, Zen, and the Search for Transcendence* (New York: Breakaway Books, 1996).
34. *Ibid.*, 12.
35. *Ibid.*, 11.
36. *Ibid.*, 13.
37. *Ibid.*, 21.
38. *Ibid.*, 25.
39. *Ibid.*, 18-20.
40. *Ibid.*, 54.
41. *Ibid.*, 67.
42. *Ibid.*, 175.
43. *Ibid.*, 176.
44. *Ibid.*
45. *Ibid.*, 178.
46. Serge Hutin notes: “on peut dire sans paradoxe que la Franc-Maçonnerie

moderne a repris et continué l'ésotérisme des Rose-Croix, reprenant leurs symboles hermétiques les plus typiques, comme la pélican, le phénix qui renaît de ses cendres, l'aigle bicéphale, etc." (one can say without paradox that modern Freemasonry has picked up and continued the esotericism of the Rosicrucians, taking up its very typical hermetic symbols, such as the pelican, the phoenix which is reborn from its own ashes, the two-headed eagle, etc.)(*Les Société's secrètes* [Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1970], 56; for the involvement of the hermeticist Robert Fludd in the rise of Freemasonry, see *ibid.*, 63).

47. J. N. Casavis claims in *The Greek Origins of Freemasonry* (New York: The Square Press, 1955) "Modern Masonry is historically based upon the Ancient Greek Mysteries" and that "Even at such a late date as the year 1583 A. D., Hermes was claimed as the founder of Freemasonry, for such he is taken and accepted in the Old Masonic manuscript No. One of the Grand Lodge of England, and in all the other old documents of the order" (*Greek Origins*, 34). A direct historical connection with antiquity is doubtful, but a strong influence through the revival of hermeticism in the Renaissance looks likely.

48. Paul Goodman, *Towards a Christian Republic: Antimasonry and the Great Transition in New England 1826-1836* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988) 167. Women were among the strongest antimasons, since the Lodges took men away from home and church; see Goodman, *ibid.*, 80ff.

49. Mark C. Carnes writes: "*The Voice of Masonry* added that because churches were attended mostly by women, they should be given a greater share of church governance. Men, on the other hand, should rest content with their exclusive dominion over the religion of the lodge" (*Secret Ritual and Manhood in Early America* [New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989], 76).

50. Carnes: "In the early twentieth century, lodges outnumbered churches in all large cities" (*Secret Ritual* 89).

51. Carnes: "The founders of fraternal groups emphasized ritual from the outset and added other activities almost by chance" (*Secret Ritual*, 9).

52. See Carnes, *Secret Ritual*, 94-107.

53. Case tries to answer the question "Why do many men prefer the lodge to the church?" but ignores the ritual aspects, concentrating on the social advantages of mutual aid and recreation. See "Men and the Lodge" in *The Masculine in Religion*, 98-99.

54. Carnes, *Secret Ritual*, 57.

55. *Ibid.*, 56-57.

56. *Ibid.*, 72.

57. Michael Rosenthal claims: "For Scouting was from the very beginning conceived as a remedy to Britain's moral, physical, and military weakness - conditions that the Boer war seemed to announce - especially to Tory politicians, social imperialists, and military leaders - were threatening the Empire (*The Character Factory: Baden-Powell and the Origins of the Boy Scout Movement* [London: Collins, 1986], 3).

58. Norman E. Richardson and Ormond E. Lewis, *The Boy Scout Movement Applied by the Church* (New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1916), 19.

59. *Boy's Life*, December 1993, 19.
60. Gilmore, *Manhood in the Making*, 65–74.
61. “A True Story of Scouts in Action: Their House Caught on Fire!” *Boys' Life*, December 1997, 44.
62. Ted Brennan, “The Point of Reenacting Battles,” *Washington Post*, 6 June 1996.
63. Klaus Theweleit, *Male Fantasies*, Vol. 1. *Women Floods Bodies History*, trans. Stephen Conway (1977. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987), Vol. II. *Male Bodies: Psychoanalyzing the White Terror*, trans. Erica Carter and Chris Turner with Stephen Conway (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989).
64. Gibson, *Warrior Dreams: Paramilitary Culture in Post-Vietnam America* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1994) 41.
65. *Ibid.*, 22.
66. *Ibid.*, 37–38.
67. Gibson, “the highest form of friendship is the brotherhood of war” (*Warrior Dreams*, 138).
68. *Ibid.*, 179.
69. *Ibid.*, 178.
70. *Ibid.*, 306.
71. *Ibid.*, 308.
72. Gibson: “No matter how secular the New Age warrior may appear with his high-tech weapons and tremendous ‘efficient’ kills, he is essentially a religious figure” (*Warrior Dreams*, 102–103). An NRA official explained to a reporter, “You would get a far better understanding if you approached us as if you were approaching one of the great religions of the world” (*Warrior Dreams*, 252). *Soldier of Fortune* magazine provides men with “religious transcendence” (*Warrior Dreams*, 167). Paramilitarism seeks to transform men, to help them transcend the secular, ordinary world into a sacred realm above the merely natural.
73. David Jones, *In Parenthesis* (New York: Chilmark Books, 1961), 153.
74. Walter Ong examines the type of education based on intellectual, masculine combat in *Fighting for Life: Contest, Sexuality, and Consciousness*. (1981. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1989).
75. Quoted in Paul Booker, *The Faces of Fraternalism: Nazi German, Fascist Italy, and Imperial Japan* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991) 62. Theodore Roosevelt puts it less elegantly: “The woman who, whether from cowardice, from selfishness, from having a false and vacuous ideal shirks her duty as wife and mother, earns the right to our contempt, just as does the man who, from any motive, fears to do his duty in battle when his country calls him” (quoted by Michael C. C. Adams, *The Great Adventure: Male Desire and the Coming of World War I* [Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1990], 7).
76. William Broyles, Jr. *Brothers in Arms: A Journey from War to Peace* (New York: Knopf, 1986), 201. Roy Raphael quotes a Stan B.: “I now almost regret that I didn’t serve overseas during the Vietnam War. I think that there must be some parallel that

war is to men what childbirth is to women. I've heard from buddies of mine who are veterans, that there's no intensity of human emotion greater than being under fire" (*The Men from the Boys: Rites of Passage in Male America* [Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1988], 150).

77. Adrian Caesar feels this implication in Owen: "For he not only criticised warfare, he celebrated, even glorified it because it is the site of suffering and of love. In his work, war is seen as appalling, but it is this very quality which engenders the loving sacrifice of the men" (*Taking It Like a Man: Suffering, Sexuality, and the War Poets* [Manchester: Manchester University Press: 1993], 167).

78. Evelyn Waugh, *The End of the Battle* (Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1961), 305.

79. Samuel Hynes points out that this is not a literary conceit: "there are moments in war when men become *different* men, who can do things that in their peacetime lives they would call monstrous and inhuman. We don't like to believe this – that men can change their essential nature—but it must be true, or there would be no atrocities. But there *are* atrocities, in every age, in every war" (*The Soldiers' Tale: Bearing Witness to Modern War* [New York: Viking Penguin, 1997], 10).

80. Jünger, *Storm of Steel* (1929. New York: Howard Fertig, 1975), 254-55.

81. *Ibid.*, 255.

82. *Ibid.*

83. *Ibid.*, 317.

84. *Ibid.*, 220.

85. *Ibid.*, 118.

86. *Ibid.*, 109.

87. It was designed by Fritz Erler for the German War Loan of 1917. It is reproduced in George L. Mosse, *Fallen Soldiers: Reshaping the Memory of the World Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), 134.

88. "The Great Sacrifice," reproduced in Joanna Bourke, *Dismembering the Male: Men's Bodies, Britain and the Great War* (London: Reaktion Books, 1996), 213.

89. George L. Mosse, *Fallen Soldiers*, 35.

90. See Gavin White, "The Martyr Cult of the First World War" in Diana Wood, ed. *Martyrs and Martyrologies: Papers Read at the 1992 Summer Meeting and the 1993 Winter Meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, for the Ecclesiastical History Society, 1993), 383-388. Georges Duhamel wrote *The New Book of Martyrs* (trans. Florence Simmonds [New York: George H. Doran Company, 1918]) about "the sacrificial victims of the race" (*ibid.* 221) who crawl "up the slopes of a Cavalry" (*ibid.*, 78).

91. Henri Barbusse, *Under Fire: The Story of a Squad*, trans. Fitzwater Wray (1917. New York: E. P. Dutton and Co., Inc., Everyman's Library, 1928), 282.

92. *Ibid.*, 357.

93. J. Glenn Gray, *The Warriors: Reflections on Men in Battle* (New York: Harper and Row, 1966), 46-47.

94. The danger and excitement of sports can also break down the barriers be-

tween men. Arnold R. Beisser observes “Perhaps some mitigation is to be found in sports and athletics. A football player who is a linebacker can encouragingly pat his lineman on the behind in full view of a hundred thousand people. Baseball players hug each other and may even kiss each other (*The Madness in Sports: Psychosocial Observations on Sports* [New York: Appleton-Century Crofts, 1967], 196). Michael Novak also sees this happening: “Sports brings out in every ideal team a form of gentleness and tenderness so intense that it is no misnomer to call it love; and coaches generally speak to their supposed macho males like golden-tongued preachers of love, brotherhood, comradeship. Tears, burning throats, and raw love of male for male are not unknown among athletes in the heat of preparation...and in the solemn battle” (*The Joy of Sports*, 46).

95. Paul Fussell, “Soldier Boys” in *The Great War and Modern Memory* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975), 270–309.

96. J. R. R. Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*. Part 3, *The Return of the King* (1965. Boston, Houghton Mifflin Company, Collector’s Edition, n.d.), 186.

97. Leo Steinberg, in *The Sexuality of Christ in Renaissance Art and Modern Oblivion* (London: Faber and Faber Limited, 1984) examines the portrayals of the sexuality of Christ. The genitals are often the central point of a Madonna and Child, and even in the Crucifixion the blood, contrary to gravity, ran down from the side to the genitals to emphasize the connection between maleness and sacrifice.

98. I believe that it is this feeling that military men refer to when they talk about *group cohesiveness* and why they say that homosexuals in a combat unit ruin it.

99. F. L. Carsten, *The Rise of Fascism*, 2nd ed. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980), 14.

100. Quoted in Caroline Tisdall and Angelo Bozzolla, *Futurism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1978), 153.

101. Mosse, *Fallen Soldiers*, 55.

102. Mussolini, although he preferred Futurism, turned against it and made Social Realism the official art of the state, because it was accessible to the masses. Similar processes of work in other totalitarian regimes strangled the avant-garde. See Igor Golomstock’s *Totalitarian Art in the Soviet Union, the Third Reich, Fascist Italy and the Peoples Republic of China*, trans. Robert Chandler (IconEditions. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1990).

103. Curzio Malaparte, *Kaputt*, trans. Cesare Foligno (Marlboro, Vermont: The Marlboro Press, 1982), 169.

104. Otto Weininger sees the formlessness of women and Jews as their common characteristic. Both lack transcendence. Weininger writes: “Die Kongruenz zwischen Judentum und Weiblichkeit scheint ein völlige zu werden, sobald auf der unendliche Veränderungsfähigkeit des Juden zu reflektieren gegonnen wird\_\_\_\_Der Jude. . . hat keinenTeil am höheren, ewigen Leben” (*Geschlecht und Charakter* [Munich: Matthew und Seitz Verlag], 429).

105. Barbara Ehrenreich,, “Forward” to Klaus Theweleit’s *Male Fantasies* Vol. 1, *Women Floods Bodies History*, xiii.

106. Ibid.

107. Raphael: “The frustrations of unfulfilled masculinity are, I fear, potentially dangerous. What if our male anxiety gets projected onto the political arena, where an overcompensation for personal inadequacy can easily get transformed into militaristic jingoism? In the wake of World War I, the severe emasculation of German males -militaristically, economically, socially—provided fertile ground for pathological politics” (*The Men from The Boys*, 187).

108. Alfred Bäumler at the beginning of the Nazi era wrote: “Mann steht daneben Mann, Säule neben Säule, das is die Schlachtreibe, das is der Tempel, das ist das Heiligum, das is der Staat” (*Männerbund und Wissenschaft* [Berlin: Junker und Dünhaupt Verlag, 1934], 39). This Männerbund with its male eros (which sometimes became openly homosexual) was the model for the SA (destroyed in the Röhm purge), and was suppressed by the Nazis in favor of a mass political movement (see Mosse, *Crisis of German Ideology: Intellectual Origins of the Third Reich* [New York: Schocken Books, 1981], 309). However, anxiety about masculinity contributed to the rise of Naziism. Elisabeth Badinter says: “the anxiety of German and Austrian men over their identity was not unrelated to the rise of Naziism and more generally to European fascism. Hitler’s accession to power resonated unconsciously with the promise that manliness would be restored” (*XY: On Masculine Identity*, trans. Lydia Davis [New York: Columbia University Press, 1995], 17).

109. Quoted by Lionel Tiger, *Men in Groups* (New York, Random House, 1969) 69.

110. This was the warning that Pope John Paul II addressed in his encyclical *Veritatis Splendor* to moral theologians who were undermining the absolute, objective nature of moral obligations. The Pope had personally experienced the results of such relativism in the Nazi occupation of Poland.

111. Hermann Rauschning was an associate of Hitler who turned against him and fled to the United States and wrote *The Revolution of Nihilism: Warning to the West* (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1939). He warned that the Nazis espoused “the utter destruction of all traditional spiritual standards, utter nihilism” (*Revolution*, xii), that even its racist philosophy was but a front for the adoration of pure power and activity without any purpose except further activity.

#### 10 *The Future of Men in the Church*

1. See Thomas C. Reeves, *The Empty Church, The Suicide of Liberal Christianity* (New York: Free Press, 1996), 146-151.

2. James E. Ditties, *Driven by Hope: Men and Meaning* (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996), 142.

3. Gordon Dalbey, *Healing the Masculine Soul: An Affirming Message for Men and the Women Who Love Them* (Waco, Texas: Word Books, 1988), 55-58.

4. Ditties, *Driven by Hope*, 9.

5. Ibid., 67.

6. Ibid., 69.

7. Ceslaus Spicq discusses this passage: “Touché de cette ferveur, le Maître répond alors le mot même de Pierre, (v. 17). Vraiment? Tu m’aimes encore? Je puis croire que tu es un ami véritable? Je puis avoir confiance en ta parole et en ton cœur?” (Touched by such fervor, the Master replies with the same word of Peter, ‘Do you love (philesi) me?’ Truly? You still love me? Can I believe that you are a true friend? Can I have confidence in your word and in your heart?)(*Agape dans le nouveau testament: Analyse des textes* [Paris: Librairie Lecoffre, 1959], 234). Many commentators see Jesus’ use of “friends” to be simply synonymous with people or neighbors, and some explicitly place the bridal relationship higher. Spicq points out that in John friendship is the most intimate type of love between the Father and the Son. The Son does what he sees the Father doing, “Il n’a pas de secret pour son Fils, qui est initié à ses pensées et ses intentions les plus cachées. L’amour de Dieu est ici un amour d’intimité, il rend compte de la confiance et des confidences du Père envers son Fils incarné qu’il traite en ami” (There is no secret from the Son, who is initiated into the most secret thoughts and intentions. The love of God is here a love of closeness, it takes account of the trust and the confidence of the Father toward the incarnate Son, whom he treats as a friend) (ibid., 220). Spicq points that that this is exactly what *philos* is, “non un amour religieux et réfléchi de supérieur à inférieur, mais un abandon spontané entre deux êtres unis par une dilection réciproque qui les met à niveau” (Not a religious love and reflected from the superior to the inferior, but a spontaneous abandon between two beings united by a reciprocal affection (ibid., 220). Aquinas along the same line defines charity as the friendship of man for God (*Summa Theologica*, IIa-IIae, Q. 23, Art. 1).

8. Thomas More is perhaps the most accessible, but his sanctity consisted in a response to crisis. Martyrdom is a clear choice, but at present, in the West anyway, outright martyrdom is rarely a possibility. The modern religious martyrs of the West whose sanctity has been recognized either officially or unofficially displayed great masculine virtues, but they were all clerics: Maximilian Kolbe, Titus Brandsma, and the priest whose deeds are the subject of the heartbreaking *Au Revoir Les Enfants*.

## *Bibliography*

- Abrams, Mark, David Gerard and Noel Timms. *Values and Social Change in Britain*. London, Macmillan, 1985.
- Adams, Michael C. C. *The Great Adventure: Male Desire and the Coming of World War I*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1990.
- Aiken, Rian W. W. "The Emergence of BornsAgain Sport" In *Religion and Sport: The Meeting of Sacred and Profane*, ed. Charles S. Prebish. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1993.
- Alacoque, Margaret Mary. *The Autobiography of Saint Margaret Mary Alacoque*. Translated by the Sisters of the Visitation. Rockford, Illinois: Tan Books and Publishers, 1986.
- Alberione, James. *Woman: Her Influence and Zeal as an Aid to the Priesthood*. Translated by the Daughters of St. Paul. Boston: St. Paul Editions, 1964.
- Allen, Prudence. *The Concept of Women: The Aristotelian Revolution 750 BC -AD 1250*. 1985. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1997.
- Alphonsus de Ligouri. *The True Spouse of Jesus Christ*. Translated and edited by Eugene Grimm. 1929. Rockford, IL; Tan Books, n.d.
- Argyle, Michael. *Religious Behaviour*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1958.
- , and Beit-Hallahmi, Benjamin. *The Social Psychology of Religion*.



- Arintero, Juan González, *The Song of Songs: A Mystical Exposition*, with a preface by Alberto Colunga. Translated by James Valender and José L. Morales. 1974. Rockford IL: Tan Books, 1992.
- Aristotle. *The Complete World of Aristotle*. 2 vols. Edited by Jonathan Barnes. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- Arnold, F. X. *Woman and Man: Their Nature and Mission*. New York: Herder and Herder, 1963.
- Arnold, Patrick M. *Wildmen, Warriors, and Kings: Masculine Spirituality in the Bible*. New York: Crossroad, 1990.
- Ashe, Kaye. *The Feminization of the Church?* Kansas City: Sheed and Ward, 1997.
- Astell, Anne. W. *The Song of Songs in the Middle Ages*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1990.
- Athanasius. *Apologia ad Constantinum*, in *Historical Tracts of S. Athanasius*. Translated by John Henry Parker. London: J. G. F. and J. Rivington, 1853.
- . *The Life of Antony and the Letter to Marcellus*. Translated by Robert C. Gregg. New York: Paulist Press, 1980.
- Badinter, Elisabeth. *XY: On Masculine Identity*. Translated by Lydia Davis. 1992. New York: Columbia University Press, 1995.
- Bakan, David. *The Duality of Human Existence: Isolation and Communion in Western Man*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1966.
- Baker, Paul M. and Kathy S. Chopik, "Abandoning the Great Dichotomy: Sex vs. Masculinity-Femininity as Predictors of Delinquency." *Sociological Inquiry* 52 (1982): 349-357.
- Baker, Derek, ed. *Medieval Women*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1978.
- Bane, Michael. *Over the Edge: A Regular Guy's Odyssey in Extreme Sports*. New York: Macmillan, 1996.
- Barbusse, Henri. *Under Fire: The Story of a Squad*. Translated by Fitzwater Wray. 1917. New York: Everyman's Library, E. P. Dutton and Co., Inc., 1928.
- Barker, Pat. *The Ghost Road*. New York: Penguin Books USA, Dutton, 1995.
- Barna, George. "The Battle for the Hearts of Men" *New Man* 4, no. 1 (January-February 1997): 43.
- . *Index of Leading Spiritual Indicators*. Dallas: Word Publishing, 1996.

- Barton, Bruce. *The Man Nobody Knows: A Discovery of the Real Jesus*. Indianapolis: Bobbs Merrill Publishing Co., 1925.
- Basher, Brenda E. *Godly Women: Fundamentalism and Female Power*, New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1998.
- Batson, C. Daniel, and W. Larry Ventis. *The Religious Experience: A Social Psychological Perspective*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1982.
- Bäumler, Alfred. *Männerbund und Wissenschaft*. Berlin: Junker und Dünnhaupt Verlag, 1934.
- Baym, Nina. "Onward Christian Women: Sarah J. Hale's History of the World." *New England Quarterly* 63 (1990): 249-270.
- Bederman, Gail. *Manliness and Civilization: A Cultural History of Gender and Race in the United States, 1880-1917*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995.
- . "The Women Have Had Charge of the Church Work Long Enough: The Men and Religion Forward Movement of 1911-1912 and the Masculinization of Middle-Class Protestantism." *American Quarterly* 41 (1981): 432-65.
- Beisser, Arnold R. *The Madness in Sports: Psychosocial Observations on Sports*. New York: Appleton-Century Crofts, 1967.
- Bell, Marion L. *Crusade in the City: Revivalism in Nineteenth Century Philadelphia*. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 1978.
- Bendroth, Margaret Lamberts. *Fundamentalism and Gender, 1875 to the Present*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Benedict. *The Rule of St. Benedict: the Abingdon Copy*. Edited by John Chamberlain. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1982.
- Benson, Peter L., and Carolyn H. Elkin. *Effective Christian Education: A National Study of Protestant Congregations, A Summary Report on Faith, Loyalty, and Congregational Life*. Minneapolis, Minn.: Search Institute, 1990.
- Beowulf*. Edited and translated by Michael Swanton. 1978. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1997.
- Bernard of Clairvaux. *On The Song of Songs*, Vol. I. Translated by Kilian Walsh. Spencer, Mass: Cistercian Publications, 1971.
- . *Treatises III: On Grace and Free Choice; In Praise of the New Knighthood*. Translated by Daniel O'Donovan and Conrad Greenia. Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications Inc., 1977.

- Bettelheim, Bruno. *Symbolic Wounds: Puberty Rites and the Envious Male*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1955.
- Bieler, Andre. *L'homme et la femme dans la morale calviniste*. Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1963.
- Bilhartz, Terry. *Urban Religion and the Second Great Awakening: Church and Society in Early National Baltimore*. Rutherford, New Jersey: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1986.
- Birgitta of Sweden. Life and Selected Revelations*. Ed. by Marguerite Tjader Harris, trans. by Albert Ryle Kezel. New York: Paulist Press, 1990.
- Blumhofer, Edith L. and Randall Balmer, eds. *Modern Christian Revivals*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993.
- Boehmer, Heinrich. *The Jesuits: An Historical Study*. Translated by Paul Zeller Strodach. Philadelphia: The Castle Press, 1928.
- Boff, Leonardo. *The Maternal Face of God: the Feminine and Its Religious Expressions*. Translated by Robert R. Barr and John W. Diercksmeier. 1979. San Francisco: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1987.
- Bolton, Brenda M. "Vitae Matrum: A Further Aspect of the *Frauenfrage*." In *Medieval Women*, edited by Derek Baker. Oxford: Blackwell, 1978.
- Booker, Paul. *The Faces of Fraternalism: Nazi German, Fascist Italy, and Imperial Japan*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1991.
- Boulard, Fernand. *Matériaux pour l'histoire religieuse du peuple français XIX<sup>e</sup>-XX<sup>e</sup> siècles*. Paris: Editions de L'Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, 1982.
- Bourke, Joanna. *Dismembering the Male: Men's Bodies, Britain and the Great War*. London: Reaktion Books, 1996.
- Bouyer, Louis. *Woman in the Church*. Translated by Marilyn Teichert. 1976. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1979.
- Boyd, Stephen, W. Merle Longwood, and Mark Muesse editors. *Redeeming Men; Religion and Masculinities*. Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996.
- Brandes, Stanley. *Metaphors of Masculinity: Sex and Status in Andalusian Folklore*. University of Pennsylvania Press, 1980.
- Bridgman, Howard Allen. "Have We a Religion for Men?" *Andover Review* (1890): 388-96.
- Brierley, Peter. *"Christian" England: What the 1989 Church Census reveals*. London: MARC Europe, 1991.

- Brown, Peter. *The Body and Society: Men, Women and Sexual Renunciation in Early Christianity*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1988.
- Broyles Jr., William. *Brothers in Arms: A Journey from war to Peace*. New York: Knopf, 1986.
- Bugge, John. *Virginitas: An Essay in the History of a Medieval Idea*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1975.
- Butler, Cuthbert. *Benedictine Monachism: Studies in Benedictine Life and Rule*. London, 1919.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. "And Woman His Humanity," In *Gender and Religion: On the Complexity of Symbol*, ed. Caroline Walker Bynum, Steven Harrell, Paula Richman. Boston: Beacon Press, 1986.
- . *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on the Human Body in Medieval Mysticism*. New York: Zone Books, 1991.
- . Harrell, Steven, and Richman, Paula, editors. *Gender and Religion: On the Complexity of Symbols*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1986.
- . *Holy Feasts and Holy Fasts: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987
- . *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982.
- Carnes, Mark C. *Secret Ritual and Manhood in Early America*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989.
- Carroll, John. "Sport: Virtue and Grace." *Theory Culture, and Society* I (1986).
- Carsten, F. L. *The Rise of Fascism*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Berkley: University of California Press, 1980.
- Carter, Paul. *Another Part of the Twenties*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1977.
- Carwardine, Richardine. *Transatlantic Revivalism*. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1978.
- Casavis, J. N. *The Greek Origins of Freemasonry*. New York: The Square Press, 1955.
- Case, Carl Delos. *The Masculine in Religion*. Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1906.
- Castelli, Jim, and Joseph Gremillion. *The Emerging Parish: The Notre Dame Study of Catholic Life Since Vatican II*. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1987.
- Catherine of Genoa. *Purgation and Purgatory, The Spiritual Dialogue*.

- Cesar, Adrian. *Taking It Like a Man: Suffering, Sexuality, and the War Poets*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1993.
- Chevasse, Claude. *The Bride of Christ: An Inquiry into the Nuptial Element in Early Christianity*. London, Faber and Faber, 1940.
- Chodorow, Nancy. *The Reproduction of Mothering: Psychoanalysis and the Sociology of Gender*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978.
- Cholvy, Gerard and Yves-Marie Hilaire. *Histoire religieuse de la France contemporaine.*, Vol. III. Toulouse: Bibliothecque histoire privat, 1985.
- Christen, Yves. *Sex Differences: Modern Biology and the Unisex Fallacy*. Translated by Nicholas Davidson. 1987. New Brunswick, New Jersey transaction Publishers, 1981.
- Christian, William A. Jr. *Person and God in a Spanish Valley*. New York and London: Seminar Press, 1972.
- Clark, Stephen B. *Man and Woman in Christ: An Examination of the Roles of Men and Women in the Light of Scripture and the Social Sciences*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Servant Books, 1986.
- Clarke, Howard W. *The Art of the Odyssey*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice, 1967.
- Coackley, John. "Friars, Sanctity, and Gender: Mendicant Encounters with Saints, 1250-1325." In *Medieval Masculinities: Regarding Men in the Middle Ages*, edited by Clare A. Lees. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994.
- Coe, George Albert. *The Psychology of Religion*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1916.
- Colgrave, Bertram, ed. and trans. *Two Lives of Saint Cuthbert: A Life by an Anonymous Monk of Lindisfarne and Bede's Prose Life*. 1940. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- Collinson, Patrick: *Godly People: Essays on English Protestantism and Puritanism*. London: Hambledon Press, 1983.
- Craig, Leon Harold. *The War Lover: A Study of Plato's Republic*. 1994. Toronto; University of Toronto Press, 1996.
- Crook, Eugene J. "Pagan Gold in Beowulf," *American Benedictine Review* 25 (1974): 218-234.
- Cross, Whitney R. *The Burned-Over District: The Social and Intellectual History of Enthusiastic Religion in Western New York, 1800-1850*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1950. New York: Harper and Row. Harper Torchbooks, 1965.

- Cumont, Franz. *The Mysteries of Mithras*. Translated by Thomas J. McCormick. 1903. New York: Dover Publications, Inc., 1956.
- Dalbey, Gordon. *Healing the Masculine Soul: An Affirming Message for Men and for the Women Who Love Them*. Waco, Texas: Word Books, 1988.
- Davidson, Nicholas. *The Failure of Feminism*. Buffalo: Prometheus Books, 1988.
- Davie, Grace. *Religion in Britain since 1945: Believing without Belonging*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1994.
- Davies, Douglas, Charles Watkins, Michael Winter. Caroline Pack, Susanne Seymour, and Christopher Smart. *Church and Religion in Rural England*. Edinburgh: T and T Clark, 1991
- De Beauvoir, Simone. *The Second Sex*. Translated and edited by H. M. Parshley. 1953. New York: Alfred E. Knopf. Everyman's Library, 1993.
- De Ganck, Roger. *Beatrice of Nazareth in Her Context*. Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1991.
- De Vaus, David, and Ian McAllister. "Gender Differences in Religion: A Test of the Structural Location Theory." *American Sociological Review* 52 (1987): 472-481.
- De Vinck, Jose. *Revelations of Women Mystics from the Middle Ages to Modern Times*. New York: Alba House, 1985.
- De Vries, Jan. *Heroic Song and Heroic Legend*. Translated by B.J. Timmer. London: 1963.
- Dictionnaire de Spiritualité, Ascétique, et Mystique, Doctrine et Histoire*, Paris: G. Beauchesne et ses fils, 1937-1995.
- Dimock Jr., George E. "The Name of Odysseus." In *Homer: A Collection of Critical Essays*, edited by George Steiner and Robert Fagles. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice, 1962.
- Dinzelbacher, Peter. *Vision und Visionnliteratur im Mittelalter*. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 1981.
- Ditties, James E. *Driven by Hope: Men and Meaning*. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996.
- The Documents of Vatican II*. Edited by Walter J. Abbott. New York: Herder and Herder, 1966.
- Dolan, Jay P. *Catholic Revivalism: the American Experience 1830 -1900*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1978.
- Douglas, Ann. *The Feminization of American Culture*. New York: Alfred E. Knopf, 1977.
- Dow, Janet H. "Beowulf and the 'Walkers in Darkness'" *Connecticut Review* 4 (1970): 42-48.

- Dragland, S. L. "Monster Man in Beowulf." *Neophilologus* 61 (1977): pp. 606-618.
- Duhamel, Georges. *The New Book of Martyrs*. Translated by Florence Simmonds. New York: George H. Doran Company, 1918.
- Dunn, Mary Marples. "Saints and Sinners: Congregational and Quaker Women in the Early Colonial Period" *American Quarterly* pp. 582-601.
- Edsman, Carl-Martin. *Le Baptême de feu*. Leipzig, Alfred F. Lorenz, 1940.
- Eitzen, D. Stanley and George H. Sage. "Sport and Religion." In *Religion and Sport*, edited by Charles S. Prebish. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1993.
- Elder, E. Rozanne. *The Spirituality of Western Christendom*, Vol 2, *The Roots of the Western Tradition*. Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, Inc., 1984.
- Eliade, Mircea. "L'initiation et le monde moderne." In *Initiation: Contributions to the Theme of the Study-Conference of the International Association of the History of Religions Held at Strasbourg, September 17<sup>th</sup> to 22<sup>nd</sup>, 1964*, edited by C. J. Bleeker. Leiden, J. Brill, 1965.
- . *Rites and Symbols of Initiation: The Mysteries of Birth and Rebirth*, Translated by Williard R. Trask. 1958. New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1965.
- Epstein, Barbara Leslie. *The Politics of Domesticity: Women, Evangelism, and Temperance in Nineteenth-Century America*. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1981.
- Evdokimov, Paul. *Woman and the Salvation of the World: A Christian Anthropology on the Charisms of Women*. Translated by Anthony P. Gythiel. Crestwood, New York: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1994.
- Everson, William O. (Brother Antoninus). *The Crooked Lines of God*. Detroit: University of Detroit Press, 1962.
- Farrell, Warren. *The Myth of Male Power: Why Men Are the Disposable Sex*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1993.
- Fasick, Laura. "Charles Kingsley's Scientific Treatment of Gender," in *Muscular Christianity: Embodying the Victorian Age*, edited by Donald E. Hall. Cambridge University Press 1994.
- Fast, Irene. *Gender Identity: A Differentiation Model*. Hillsdale, New Jersey: The Analytic Press, 1984.
- Fichter, Joseph H. *Social Relations in the Urban Parish*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1954.

- John Chrysostom*. South Canaan, Pennsylvania: St. Tikhon's Seminary Press, 1996.
- Forrest, Tom. "Is the Church Attractive to Men?" *Origins* 17, no. 21 (November 5, 1987)
- Fosdick, Harry Emerson. *The Manhood of the Master*. New York: Association Press, 1913.
- Fussell, Paul. *The Great War and Modern Memory*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1975.
- Fussell, Sam. *Muscle: Confessions of an Unlikely Bodybuilder*. 1991. New York: Avon Books, 1992
- Gallup, George Jr., and Jim Castelli. *The People's Religion: American Faith in the 90's*. New York, Macmillan, 1989.
- Gerard, David. "Religious Attitudes and Values" in *Values and Social Change in Britain*. Edited by Mark Abrams, David Gerard and Noel Timms. London: Macmillan, 1985.
- Gertrude of Helfta. *The Herald of Divine Love*. Translated and edited by Margaret Winckworth. New York: Paulist Press, 1993.
- Gibson, James William. *Warrior Dreams: Paramilitary Culture in Post-Vietnam America*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1994.
- Gilkes, C. T. "Together and in Harness: Women's Traditions in the Sanctified Churches." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 10 (1985): 678-699. 1985
- Gillam, Doreen M. E. "The use of the term 'æglæca' in Beowulf at Lines 893 and 2592." *Neophilologus* 61 (1977): 600-618.
- Gilmore, David D. *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990.
- Godbeer, Richard. "'Love Raptures': Marital, Romantic, and Erotic Images of Jesus Christ in Puritan New England, 1670-1730." *New England Quarterly* 68 (1990): 355-84.
- Goldberg, Herb. *The Hazards of Being Male: Surviving the Myth of Male Privilege*. 1976. New York: Signet, 1987.
- Goldwert, Marvin. "Machismo and Christ: The New Formula." *Contemporary Review* 145 (1984): 184-185.
- Golomstock, Igor. *Totalitarian Art in the Soviet Union, the Third Reich, Fascist Italy and the People's Republic of China*. Icon Editions. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1990.



- Gorn, Elliot J. *The Manly Art: Bare-Knuckle Prize Fighting in America*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- Graef, Hilda. *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion*. 1963. Westminster, Maryland: Christian Classics, 1985.
- Graham, Ruth. "Women versus Clergy, Women pro Clergy." In *French Women and the Age of the Enlightenment*, edited by Samia I. Spencer. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984.
- Gray, J. Glenn. *The Warriors: Reflections on Men in Battle*. New York: Harper and Row, 1966.
- Greenson, Ralph R. "Dis-Identifying from Mother: Its Special Importance for the Boy" *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*. 49 (1968): 370-74.
- Grundmann, Herbert. *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter: Untersuchungen über die geschichtlichen Zusammenhänge zwischen der Ketzerei, den Bettelorden und der religiösen Grundlagen der deutschen Mystik*, 2nd rev. ed. with supplement, "Neue Beiträge..." Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1961.
- . *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages*. Translated by Steven Rowan. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995.
- Gudorf, Christine E. "Renewal or Repatriarchalization." *Horizons* 10 (1982): 231-51.
- Guentert, Kenneth. "Kids Need to Learn Their Faith From Men, Too." *U.S. Catholic*, February 1990, 14-16.
- Hadewijch: The Complete Works*. Translated by Columba Hart. New York: Paulist Press, 1980.
- Hale, Sarah J. *Women's Record: or Sketches of Distinguished Women*. New York, Harper and Brothers, 1860.
- Hall, Donald E., ed. *Muscular Christianity: Embodying the Victorian Age*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1994.
- Hall, G. Stanley. *Adolescence, Its Psychology and Its Relation to Physiology, Anthropology, Sociology, Sex, Crime, Religion, and Education*. 2 vols. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1911.
- Hansen, Ron. *Mariette in Ecstasy*. HarperCollins Publishers, Harper Perennial, 1991.
- Hardenbrook, Weldon M. *Missing from Action: Vanishing Manhood in America*. Nashville, Tn.: Thomas Nelson, 1987.
- Harrison, James. "Warning: the Male Sex Role May Be Dangerous to Your

- Perspectives in the History of Women*. New York: Harper and Row, 1974.
- Harvey, Robert. *Ignatius Loyola: A General in the Church Militant*. Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing Co., 1937.
- Hauke, Manfred. *God or Goddess? Feminist Theology: What Is It? Where Does It Lead?* Translated David Kipp. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1995.
- . *Women in the Priesthood: A Systematic Analysis in the Light of the Order of Creation and Redemption*. Translated by David Kipp. 1986. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1988.
- Heine, Susanne. *Women and Early Christianity: A Reappraisal*. Translated by John Bowden. 1987. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1988.
- The Heliand: The Saxon Christ*. Translated by G. Ronald Murphy. New York: Oxford University Press, 1992.
- Henderson, Alice Corbin. *Brothers of Light: The Penitentes of the Southwest*. New York: Harcourt, Brace, and Co., 1937.
- Henry, P. L. "Furor Heroicus" *Studia Germanica Gandensis* 3 (1961): 235-242.
- Herd, Gilbert A. *Guardians of the Flutes: Idioms of Masculinity*. New York: McGraw Hill Book Company, 1981.
- Herik, Judith van. *Freud on Femininity and Faith*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982.
- Herlihy, Davis. "Life Expectancies for Women in Medieval Society" in *The Role of Women in the Middle Ages*, edited by Rosemary Morewedge. Albany: State University of New York, 1975.
- Hewitt, W. E. "Basic Christian Communities of the Middle - Classes in the Archdiocese of Sāp Paolo" *Sociological Analysis* 48 (1987): 158-66.
- Hildegard of Bingen, *Symphonia: A Critical Edition of the Symphonia armonie celestium revelationum [Symphony of the Harmony of Celestial Revelations]*. Translated and edited by Barbara Newman. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988.
- Hilliard, David. "UnEnglish and Unmanly: Anglo-Catholicism and Homosexuality." *Victorian Studies* 25 (1982): 181-210.
- Hitchcock, Helen Hull. *The Politics of Prayer: Feminist Language and the Worship of God*. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1992.
- Hoge, Dean R., and David A. Roozen. "Research on Factors Influencing Church Commitment." In *Understanding Church Growth and Decline, 1950-*

- Homer. *The Odyssey of Homer*. Translated Richard Lattimore. 1965, New York: Perennial Library, Harper 1975.
- Hood, William. *Fra Angelico at San Marco*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Horney, Karen. "The Dread of Women." *International Journal of Psycho-Analysis* 13 (1932): 348-360.
- Horowitz, Helen Lefkowitz. *Alma Mater: Desire and Experience in the Women's Colleges from Their Nineteenth Century Beginnings to the 1930's*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1985.
- Howe, Elizabeth Teresa. *Mystical Imagery: Santa Teresa de Jesus and San Juan de la Cruz*. New York: Peter Lang, 1987.
- Howitt, Alfred W. *The Native Tribes of South-East Australia*. London: Macmillan, 1904.
- Hudson, Liam and Bernadine Jacot. *The Way Men Think: Intellect, Intimacy, and the Erotic Imagination*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991.
- Hudson, Winthrop S. *American Protestantism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961.
- Hughes, Thomas. *Tom Brown's Schooldays*. New York: Puffin Books, 1983.
- Hutin, Serge. *Les Sociétés secrètes*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1970.
- Hynes, Samuel. *The Soldiers' Tale: Bearing Witness to Modern War*. New York: Viking Penguin, 1997.
- Ignatius of Loyola: Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*. Translated and edited by George E. Ganss. New York: Paulist Press, 1991.
- Jacobs, Eric and Robert Worcester. *We British: Britain under the MORIScope*. London: Weidenfield and Nicholson, 1990.
- James, David C. *What Are They Saying About Masculine Spirituality?* New York: Paulist Press, 1996.
- James, John Angell. *Female Piety*, 1860. Pittsburgh: Soli Deo Gloria Publications, 1994.
- Jantzen, Grace M. *Power, Gender and Christian Mysticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jarrett, Bede. *Social Theories of the Middle Ages, 1200- 1500*. New York: F. Ungar, 1966.
- John Paul II. *On the Dignity and Vocation of Women (Mulieris Dignitatem)*. Vatican translation. Boston: St. Paul Books and Media, n. d.
- . *Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordi-*

- Johnson, Curtis D. *Island of Holiness: Rural Religion in Upstate New York 1790-1860*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- Johnson, Paul. *A Shopkeeper's Millennium: Society and Revivals in Rochester, New York 1815-1837*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1978.
- Johnson, Paul. "Anglicanism, Organic Sin, and the Church of Sodom" *The Spectator* 277 (Nov. 22, 1996): p. 30.
- Jones, David. *In Parenthesis*. New York: Chilmark Books, 1961.
- Julian of Norwich. *The Revelation of Divine Love in Sixteen Showings*. Translated by M. L. del Mastro. Ligouri, Missouri: Ligouri Publications, Triumph Books, 1994.
- Jünger, Ernst. *Storm of Steel*. 1929. New York: Howard Fertig, 1975.
- Kaspar, Walter. "Church as *communio*" *Communio* vol. 13, no. 2 (Summer 1986): 100-17
- Kauffman, Christopher J. *Faith and Fraternalism: The History of the Knights of Columbus 1882-1982*. New York: Harper and Row, 1982.
- Kett, Joseph *Rites of Passage: Adolescence in America 1790 to the Present*. New York: Basic Books, 1977.
- King, Catherine Callen. *Achilles: Paradigms of the War Hero from Homer to the Middles Ages*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987.
- Kingsley, Charles. *Charles Kingsley: His Letters and His Age*. 2 vols. London: Henry S. King and Co., 1877.
- Kirkley, Evelyn A. "Is It Manly To Be Christian? The Debate in Victorian and Modern America" In *Redeeming Men; Religion and Masculinities*, edited by Stephen B. Boyd, W. Merle Longwood, and Mark Muesse. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996.
- Klein, Alan M. *Little Big Men: Bodybuilding Subculture and Gender Construction*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993.
- Kling, David W. *A Field of Divine Wonders: The New Divinity and Village Revivals in Northwestern Connecticut 1792-1822*. University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1993.
- Knox, Ronald A. *Enthusiasm: A Chapter in the History of Religion*. 1950. Westminster, Md.: Christian Classics, 1983
- Kosmin, Barry A., and Seymour P. Lachman. *One Nation Under God: Religion in Contemporary American Society*. Harmony Books, New York. 1993.
- Kristeva, Julia *In the Beginning Was Love: Psychoanalysis and Love*. Trans-

- religieuse*. Vol 3, *Du rois Chrétien à la laïcité républicaine*, edited by Jacques Le Goff. Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1991.
- Le Bras, Gabriel. *Etudes de sociologie religieuse*. 2 vols. Paris: Presses Universitaire de France, 1955.
- Le Goff, Jacques. *The Birth of Purgatory*. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. 1981. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984.
- . *Histoire de la France religieuse*. Vol. 3, *Du rois Très Chrétien à la laïcité républicaine*. Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1991
- Leclercq, Jean. *Monks and Love in Twelfth Century France: Psycho-Historical Essays*. Oxford: at the Clarendon Press, 1979.
- , François Vandenbroucke and Louis Bouyer. *The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*. Translated by the Benedictines of Holmes Eden Abbey. 1961. London, Burns and Oates, 1968.
- Lees, Clare A., ed. *Medieval Masculinities: Regarding Men in the Middle Ages*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994.
- Leinhard, Marc. "Luther and the Beginnings of the Reformation." In *Christian Spirituality*, edited by Jill Raitt.
- Lenski, Gerhard E. "Social Correlates of Religious Interest." *American Sociological Review* 18 (1953): 533-44.
- Levant, Ronald F. and William S. Pollack, editors. *A New Psychology of Men*. New York: Basic Books, 1995.
- Levant, Ronald F. "Toward a Reconstruction of Masculinity." In *A New Psychology of Men*, edited by Ronald F. Levant and William S. Pollack.
- Levin, Michael. *Feminism and Freedom*. New Brunswick: Transaction Books, 1987.
- Lewis, Gilbert. "Payback and Ritual in War in New Guinea." In *War: A Cruel Necessity? The Bases of Institutionalized Violence*, ed. Robert A. Hinde and Helen E. Watson London.
- The Life of Beatrice of Nazareth*. Edited and translated by Roger De Ganck with the assistance of John Baptist Housbrouck. Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications, 1991
- Lison-Tolosana, Carmela. *Belmonte de los Cabelleros: A Sociological Study of a Spanish Town*. 1966. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983.
- Maccoby, Eleanor Emmons and Carol Nagy Jacklin. *The Psychology of Sex Differences*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974.
- Macleod, David I. *Building Character in the American Boy: The Boy Scouts*,

- Mahon, Leo T. "Machismo and Christianity." *Catholic Mind* 63 (February 1965): 4-11.
- Miao, Eugene S. *St. John of the Cross: The Imagery of Eros*. Madrid: Playor, 1973.
- Malaperte, Curzio. *Kaputt*. Translated by Cesare Foligno. 1946. Marlboro, Vermont: The Marlboro Press, 1982.
- Malmgreen, Gail. "Domestic Discords: Women and the Family in East Cheshire Methodism, 1750 - 1830." In *Disciplines of Faith: Studies in Religion, Patriarchy, and Politics*, edited by Jim Obelkevich, Lyndal Roper, and Raphael Samuel. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987.
- Malone, Edward C. *The Monk and the Martyr: The Monk as the Successor of the Martyr*. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1950.
- Malperte, Curzio. *Kaputt*. 1946. Marlboro, Vermont: The Marlboro Press, 1982.
- Mangan, J. A. *Athleticism in the Victorian and Edwardian Public Schools: The Emergence and Consolidation of an Educational Ideology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.
- Marcilhacy, Christianne. *Le Diocèse d'Orléans sous le épiscopat de Msgr. Dupanloup*. Paris: Librairie Plon, 1962.
- Margaret Ebner. *Major Works*. Translated and edited by Leonard P. Hindsley. New York: Paulist Press, 1993.
- Martin David A. *A Sociology of English Religion*. London: SCM Press Ltd, 1967.
- Martin, Francis. *The Feminist Question: Feminist Theology in the Light of the Christian Tradition*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Company, 1994.
- . "Feminist Theology: A Proposal." *Communio* 20 (1993): 334-76.
- Matarasso, Pauline, ed. and trans. *The Cistercian World: Monastic Writings of the Twelfth Century*, New York: Penguin Books, 1993.
- Mather, Cotton. *Ornaments for the Daughter of Sion*. Boston, 1648.
- . *A Glorious Espousal*. Boston, 1719.
- Mathews, Donald G. *Religion in the Old South*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977.
- McCartney, Bill. "God is Calling Us to a Higher Love," in *Go the Distance: The Making of a Promise Keeper*, ed. John Trent. Colorado Springs,

- Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1986; Midland Book Edition, 1994.
- McDannell, Colleen. "True Men as We Need Them: Catholicism and the Irish-American Male." *American Studies* 27 (1986): 19-36.
- McDonnell, Ernest W. *The Beguines and Beghards in Medieval Culture with Special Emphasis on the Belgian Scene*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1954.
- McGinn, Bernard and John Meyendorff, eds. *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the thirteenth Century*. New York: Crossroad, 1986.
- McLeod, Hugh. *Piety and Poverty: Working-Class Religion in Berlin, London, and New York*. New York: Holmes and Meier, 1996.
- McLeod, Hugh. *Religion and Society in England, 1850-1914*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1966.
- Mead, Margaret. *Male and Female: A Study of the Sexes in a Changing World*. 1944. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1977.
- Messner, Michael A. *Power at Play: Sports and the Problem of Masculinity*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1992.
- Michelet, Jules. *Du Prêtre, de la femme, de la famille*. 4<sup>th</sup> Edition. Paris: Hachette, 1845.
- Miles, Rosalind. *The Rites of Man: Love, Sex and Death in the Making of the Male*. London: Grafton Books, 1991.
- Miller, John W. *Biblical Faith and Fathering: Why We Call God "Father."* Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1989.
- Miller, Perry. "Jonathan Edward's Sociology of the Great Awakening." *New England Quarterly* 21 (1948): pp. 50-77.
- Moberg, David O. *The Church as Social Institution: The Sociology of American Religion*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, Inc., 1962.
- Moller, Herbert. "Sex Composition and Correlated Culture Patterns of Colonial America." *William and Mary Quarterly*, 2 (1945): 113-53.
- Montague, George T. *Our Father, Our Mother: Mary and the Faces of God*. Steubenville, Ohio: Franciscan University Press, 1990.
- Moore, Harold G. and Joseph L. Galloway. *We Were Soldiers Once...and Young: la Drang - The Battle That Changed the War in Vietnam*. New York: Random House, 1992.
- Moore, James R. *Religion in Victorian Britain*. Vol. 3, *Sources*, Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1988.

- Moran, Gerald F. "Christian Revivalism in Early America." In Blumhofer and Balmer, eds. *Modern Christian Revivalism*, edited Edith L. Blumhofer and Randall Balmer.
- Moran, Gerald F. and Maris A. Vinovskis. *Religion, Family, and the Life Course: Explorations in the Social History of Early America*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1992.
- Morewedge, Rosemarie, ed. *The Role of Women in the Middle Ages*. Albany: State University of New York, 1975.
- Morgan, William J. "An Existential, Phenomenological Analysis of Sport as a Religious Experience." In Charles S. Prebish, editor, *Religion and Sport: The Meeting of Sacred and Profane*.
- Mosse, George L. *The Crisis of German Ideology*. 1964. New York: Schocken Books, 1981.
- . *Fallen Soldiers: Reshaping the Memory of the World Wars*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.
- Mrozek, Donald J. *Sports and American Mentality 1880-1910*. Knoxville, University of Tennessee Press, 1983.
- Mudie-Smith, Richard. *The Religious Life of London*. London: Hodder and Saughton, 1904.
- Myers, Carol. *Discovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Myers, Cortland. *Why Men Do Not Go to Church*. New York: Funk and Wagnalls Co., 1899.
- Nelson, Claudia. "Sex and the Single Boy: Ideals of Manliness and Sexuality in Victorian Literature." *Victorian Studies* 32 (1989): 525-55.
- Nelson, James B. *The Intimate Connection: Male Sexuality, Male Spirituality*. Philadelphia, The Westminster Press, 1988.
- Nesbitt, Paula D. *Feminization of the Clergy in America: Occupational and Organizational Perspectives*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Newman, Barbara. *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995.
- Nietzsche, Friedrich. *Basic Writings of Nietzsche*. Translated and edited by Walter Kaufman. New York: Modern Library, 1968.
- Novak, Michael. *The Joy of Sports: End Zones, Bases, Baskets, Balls, and the Consecration of the American Spirit* rev. ed. 1967. Lanham, Maryland:



- Oberman, Heiko A. *Luther: Man Between God and the Devil*. Translated by Eileen Walliser-Schwartzbart. 1982. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989.
- Oddie, William. "My Time at Homoerotic College" *The Spectator* 277 (7 December 1996): 26.
- . *What Will Happen to God? Feminism and the Reconstruction of Christian Belief*. 1984. San Francisco: Ignatius. 1988.
- Ong, Walter. *Fighting for Life: Contest, Sexuality, and Consciousness*. 1981. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1989.
- Origen. *Contra Celsum* 3.45, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Vol. 4. Edited by Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson. 1885. Henrickson Publishers, Inc., 1995.
- . *The Song of Songs: Commentary and Homilies*. Translated by R. P. Lawson. Westminster, Maryland: The Newman Press, 1957.
- Otto, Rudolf. *The Idea of the Holy*. 1923. Oxford University Press, 1958.
- Ownby, Ted. *Subduing Satan: Religion, Recreation, and Manhood in the Rural South 1965-1920*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990.
- Pable, Martin W. *A Man and His God*. Notre Dame: Ave Maria Press, 1988.
- Pearse, Edward. *The Best Match: or the Souls Espousal to Christ, opened and approved*. London, 1673.
- Pennington, Basil. "The Cistercians." In *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Thirteenth Century*, edited by Bernard McGinn and John Meyendorff. New York: Crossroad, 1986.
- Petroff, Elizabeth Alvida. *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1986.
- Pickstone, Charles. *The Divinity of Sex: The Search for Ecstasy in a Secular Age*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996.
- Pike, Nelson. *Mystic Union: An Essay in the Phenomenology of Mysticism*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1992.
- Pittman, III, Frank S. *Man Enough: Fathers, Sons and the Search for Masculinity*. New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1993.
- Pope, Robert G. *The Half-Way Covenant: Church Membership in Puritan New England*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969.
- Porterfield, Amanda. *Female Piety in Puritan New England: The Emergence of Religious Humanism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1992.
- . *Feminine Spirituality in America: From Sarah Edwards to Martha Graham*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1980.

- Rahner, Hugo. *Greek Myths and Christian Mystery*. 1957. London: Bums and Oats, 1963.
- Raitt, Jill ed. *Christian Spirituality: High Middle Ages and the Reformation*. New York: Crossroad, 1987.
- Randall, Robert. Return of the Pleiades. *Natural History* 96 (June 1987): 43-52.
- Raphael, Roy. *The Men from the Boys: Rites of Passage in Male America*. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1988.
- Rauschenbusch, Walter. *Christianity and the Social Gospel*. 1970. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster / John Knox Press, 1991.
- Rauschnig, Hermann. *The Revolution of Nihilism: Warning to the West*. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1939.
- Reed, John Shelton. "A Female Movement: The Feminization of Nineteenth Century Anglo-Catholicism." *Anglican and Episcopal History* 57 (1988): 199-238.
- Reed, John Shelton. "'Giddy Young Men' A Counter-Cultural Aspect of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism." *Comparative Social Research* 11 (1989): 209-226.
- Reed, John Shelton. *Glorious Battle: The Cultural Politics of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism*. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 1996.
- Reeves, Thomas C. *The Empty Church, The Suicide of Liberal Christianity*. New York: Free Press, 1996.
- Renzetti, Claire M., and Daniel J. Curran. *Women, Men, and Society: The Sociology of Gender*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1989.
- Reuther, Rosemary Radford. "Christianity and Women in the Modern World." In *Today's Women in World Religions*, ed. Arvind Sharma. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994.
- Reuther, Rosemary Radford and Rosemary Skinner Keller. *Women and Realignment in America*. Vol 1, *The Nineteenth Century*. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1981.
- Richardson, Norman E. and Ormond E. Lewis. *The Boy Scout Movement Applied by the Church*. New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1916.
- Roblack, Ulinka. "Female Spirituality and the Infant Jesus in Late Medieval Dominican Convents." *Gender and History* 6 (1994): 37-57.
- Roisin, Simone. *L'Hagiographie cistercienne dans le diocèse de Liege au XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*. Louvain: Bibliotheque de l'Université, 1947.

- Rosen, David. "The volcano and the cathedral: muscular Christianity and the origins of primal manliness." In *Muscular Christianity: Embodying the Victorian Age*, edited by Donald E. Hall.
- Rosenthal, Michael. *The Character Factory: Baden-Powell and the Origins of the Boy Scout Movement*. London: Collins, 1986.
- Rubin, Miri. *Corpus Christ: The Eucharist in Late Medieval Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Ryan, Mary. *Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County, New York*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.
- Sapp, Stephen. *Sexuality, the Bible, and Science*. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 19XX.
- Schaller, Lyle E. *Its a Different World: the Challenge for Today's Pastor*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1987.
- Schindler, David L. *Heart of the Church, Heart of the World: Communio Ecclesiology, Liberalism, and Liberation*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1996.
- Schmöger, Carl E. 1885. *The Life of Anne Catherine Emmerich*. Rockford, Ill.: Tan Books and Publishers, Inc. 1976.
- Schneider-Böklen and Dorothea Vorländer. *Feminismus und Glaube*. Mainz: Matthia-Grünwald-Verlag, 1991.
- Schultheis, Rob. *Bone Games: Extreme Sports, Shamanism, Zen, and the Search for Transcendence*. 1984. New York: Breakaway Books, 1996.
- Sexton, Patricia Cayo. *The Feminized Male: Classrooms, White Collars, and the Decline of Manliness*. New York: Vintage, 1969.
- Sharma, Arvin, ed. *Today's Women in World Religions*. Albany, State University of New York Press, 1994.
- Sheilds, Richard D. "The Feminization of American Congregationalism 1730-1835." *American Quarterly* 33 (Spring 1981), 46-62.
- Slushier, Howard. "Sport and the Religious." In *Religion and Sport: The Meeting of Sacred and Profane*, edited by Charles S. Prebish. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1993.
- Southern, R. W. *Western Society and Church in the Middle Ages*. Harnondworth: Penguin Books, 1970.
- Spencer, Samia I., ed. *French Women and the Age of the Enlightenment*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984.
- Spicq, Ceslaus. *Agape dans le nouveau testament: Analyse des textes*. Paris:

- Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996.
- Starr, Ann Lee. *The Bible Status of Women*. New York: F. H. Revell Co., 1926. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1987.
- Stearns, Peter N. *Be a Man! Males in Modern Society*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Holmes and Meier, 1990.
- Steinberg, Leo. *The Sexuality of Christ in Renaissance Art and Modern Oblivion*. London: Faber and Faber Limited, 1984.
- Stoller, Robert J. *Presentations of Gender*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985.
- Strauss, Leo. "On the Interpretation of Genesis." *L'homme* 21 (1981): 5-20.
- Straw, Carole. *Gregory the Great: Perfection in Imperfection*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1988.
- Suso, Henry. *The Exemplar: Life and Writings of Blessed Henry Suso*. 2 vol. Edited by Nicholas Heller and translated by Sister M. Ann Edward. Dubuque, Iowa: The Priory Press, 1962.
- Tanner, J. M. *Fetus Into Man: Physical Growth from Conception to Maturity*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1978.
- Taylor, Edward. *The Poems of Edward Taylor*. Edited by Donald E. Stanford. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1960.
- Terman, Lewis M. and Catherine Cox Miles, assisted by Jack W. Dunlop and others. *Sex and Personality: Studies an Masculinity and Femininity*. 1936. New York: Russell and Russell, 1968.
- Theweleit, Klaus. *Male Fantasies*. Vol. 1, *Women Floods Bodies History*. Translated by Stephen Conway. 1977. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987. Vol. 2, *Male Bodies: Psychoanalyzing the White Terror*. Translated by Erica Carter and Chris Turner in collaboration with Stephen Conway. 1978. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989.
- Thomas Aquinas, *Basic Writings of Saint Thomas Aquinas*, 2 vols. Edited by Anton C. Pegis. New York: Random House, 1945.
- Thomas, David. *Not Guilty: In Defense of Men*. New York: William Murrow and Company, Inc.
- Thompson, Jr., Edward H. "Beneath the Status Characteristic: Gender Variations in Religiousness." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 30 (1991): 381-394.
- Thompson, Sally. "The Problem of the Cistercian Nuns in the Twelfth and Early Thirteenth Century." In *Medieval Women*, edited by Derek Baker. Oxford: Blackwell, 1978.

- Tillich, Paul. *Systematic Theology*. 3 vols. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951-1963.
- Tisdall, Caroline and Angelo Bozzolla. *Futurism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1978.
- Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Lord of the Rings*. 1965. Boston, Houghton Mifflin Company, Collector's Edition, n.d.
- Toon, Peter. *Let Women Be Women: Equality, Ministry, and Ordination*. Gracewing, Leominster: Fowler Wright Books, 1990.
- Treadwell, Perry. "Biological Influences on Masculinity." In *The Making of Masculinities: the New Mens Studies*, edited by Harry Brod.
- Trent, John, ed. *Go the Distance; The Making of a Promise Keeper*. Colorado Springs, Colorado: Focus on the Family Publishing, 1996.
- Trollope, Frances. *Domestic Manners of the Americans*. 2 vols. New York: Dodd, Meade, and Company, 1894.
- Turner, Denys. *Eros and Allegory: Medieval Exegesis of the Song of Songs*. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1995.
- Turner, Victor. "Betwixt and Between: The Liminal Period in Rites of Passage." In *Betwixt and Between: Patterns of Masculine and Feminine Initiation*, edited by Louise Carus Mahdi, Steven Foster, and Meredith Little. LaSalle, Illinois: Open Court, 1987.
- Van Gennep, Arnold. *The Rites of Passage*. Translated by Monika K. Vizedom and Gabrielle L. Caffee. 1909. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1960.
- Vance, Norman. *The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- Vauchez, André. *The Laity in the Middle Ages: Religious Beliefs and Devotional Practices*. Edited by Daniel E. Boorstein and translated by Margery J. Schneider. Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 1993.
- Vauchez, André. *La Sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du moyen age*. Rome: École Française de Rome, 1981.
- Vizedom, Monika. *Rites and Relationships: Rites of Passage and Contemporary Anthropology*. Sage Research Papers in the Social Sciences: Cross Cultural Studies Series, No. 90-027, vol. 4. 1976.
- Von Balthasar, Hans Urs. *Dare we Hope "That All Men Be Saved"* with A Short Discourse on Hell. Translated by David Kripp and Lothar Krauth. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1988.

- cisco: Ignatius Press, 1986.
- . *Theodramatik*, Vol 4. *Das Endspiel*. Einsiedeln: Johannes Verlag, 1983.
- Von Hügel, Friedrich. *The Mystical Element in Religion as Studied in Catherine of Genoa and Her Friends*. 2 vols. London: M. Dents and Sons, 1927.
- Von le Fort, Gertrud. *Eternal Woman: The Woman in the Timeless Woman* Translated by Placid Jordan. Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing Co., 1961.
- Von Rad, Gerhard. *Old Testament Theology*. Translated by I. D. M. G. Stalker. New York: 1962.
- Walter, Tony. "Why Are Most Churchgoers Women?" *Vox Evangelica* 20 (1990): 73-90.
- Warner, Marina. "Blood and Tears." *New Yorker* 72, no. 7. (April 8, 1996): pp. 63-69.
- Warren, Anna K. *Anchorites and Their Patrons in Medieval England*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985.
- Waugh, Evelyn. *Brideshead Revisited*. 1945. Boston: Little, Brown, and Co., 1978.
- . *The End of the Battle*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1961.
- . *When the Going Was Good*. Boston: Little, Brown, and Co., 1984.
- Weinandy, Thomas G. *The Father's Spirit of Sonship: Reconceiving the Trinity*. Edinburgh: T and T Clark, 1995.
- Weinginer, Otto. *Geschlecht und Charakter*. 1906. Munich: Matthew und Seitz Verlag, 1980.
- Weinstein, Donald and Bell, Rudolph M. *Saints and Society: Christendom, 1000 - 1700*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977.
- Weisner, Merry? "Luther and Women: The Death of Two Marys." In *Disciplines of Faith*, edited by Jim Obelkevich, Lyndal Roper, and Raphael Samuel.
- Welter, Barbara. "The Feminization of American Religion: 1800-1860." In *Clio's Consciousness Raised: New Perspectives in the History of Women*, edited by Mary S. Hartman and Lois Banner. New York: Harper and Row, 1974.
- Wessley, Stephen E. "The Thirteenth-Century Guglielmites: Salvation Through Women." In *Medieval Women*, edited by Derek Baker.
- White, Gavin. "The Martyr Cult of the First World War." In *Martyrs and Martyrologies: Papers Read at the 1992 Summer Meeting and the 1993*

- White, John K. "Men and the Church: A Case Study of Ministry to Men in a Medium Size Congregation" D.M. Thesis, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, Deerfield, Illinois, 1990.
- Wilcock, Ed. "How We Lost Our Manliness." *Integrity?* (May 1955): 12.
- Wiley, Juli Loesch. "In Defense of God the Father." In *The Politics of Prayer: Feminist Language and the Worship of God*, ed. Helen Hull Hitchcock. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1992.
- Willoughby, Harold W. *Pagan Regeneration: A Study of Mystery Initiations in the Greco-Roman World*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1929. Midway Reprint, 1974.
- Wolff, Hope Nash. *A Study in the Narrative Structure of Three Epic Poems: Gilgamesh, The Odyssey, Beowulf*. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1987.
- Wood, Diana, editor. *Martyrs and Martyrologies: Papers Read at the 1992 Summer Meeting and the 1993 Winter Meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993.
- Woodward, Kenneth. "Gender and Religion: Who's Really Running the Show." *Commonweal* 120:6: 9-14.

## A NOTE ON THE AUTHOR

LEON J. PODLES earned his bachelor's degree at Providence College and his doctorate in English at the University of Virginia. He later studied Old Icelandic at the University of Iceland. He has worked as a teacher and federal investigator and has written for numerous journals, including *America*, the *American Spectator*, *Crisis*, and the *American Enterprise*. He is a contributing editor of *Touchstone*. He is president of Crossland Foundation, serves on the board of BishopAccountability.org and is a Boy Scout leader. He is married and has six children.



This book was published in the Adobe PDF format by the  
Crossland Foundation.

For more information visit *[www.CrosslandFoundation.org](http://www.CrosslandFoundation.org)*

